

Narrow range of early habitable Venus scenarios permitted by modeling of oxygen loss and radiogenic argon degassing

Alexandra O. Warren^{a,1} D and Edwin S. Kite^a

Edited by Mark Thiemens, University of California, San Diego, La Jolla, CA; received June 11, 2022; accepted January 13, 2023

Whether Venus was ever habitable is a key question driving missions to Earth's sister planet in the next decade. Venus today has a dry, O2-poor atmosphere, but recent work has proposed that early Venus may have had liquid water [J. Krissansen-Totton, J. J. Fortney, F. Nimmo, Planet. Sci. J. 2, 216 (2021)] and reflective clouds that could have sustained habitable conditions until 0.7 Ga [J. Yang, G. Boué, D. C. Fabrycky, D. S. Abbot, Astrophys. J. 787, L2 (2014), M. J. Way, A. D. Del Genio, J. Geophys. Res.: Planets 125, e2019JE006276 (2020)]. Water present at the end of a habitable era must since have been lost by photodissociation and H escape, causing buildup of atmospheric oxygen [F. Tian, Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 432, 126-132 (2015)]. We present a time-dependent model of Venus's atmospheric composition starting from the end of a hypothetical habitable era with surface liquid water. We find that O2 loss to space, oxidation of reduced atmospheric species, oxidation of lava, and oxidation of a surface magma layer formed in a runaway greenhouse climate can remove O2 from up to 500 m global equivalent layer (GEL) (30% of an Earth ocean), unless melts on Venus had a much lower oxygen fugacity than Mid Ocean Ridge melts on Earth, which increases the upper limit twofold. Volcanism is required to supply oxidizable fresh basalt and reduced gases to the atmosphere but also contributes ⁴⁰Ar. Consistency with Venus's modern atmospheric composition occurs in less than 0.4% of runs, in a narrow parameter range where the reducing power introduced by O2 loss processes can balance O2 introduced by H escape. Our models favor hypothetical habitable eras ending before 3 Ga and very reduced melt oxygen fugacities three log units below the fayalite-magnetite-quartz buffer ($f_{O_2} < FMQ-3$), among other constraints.

Venus | atmospheric evolution | water

Did Venus ever have liquid water? Answering this question is one of the core questions driving the fleet of new missions to Venus selected by NASA and ESA, the terrestrial planet most similar in size to the Earth in our solar system (1). Today, Venus has an average surface temperature of 720 K, and a dry 93-bar, predominantly CO_2 atmosphere. These conditions preclude the stability of water and most hydrous minerals on its present-day surface (2). Although some studies of Venus's climate evolution suggest that the planet has always been uninhabitably hot (3–5), other modeling studies propose that Venus may have been able to maintain surface temperatures low enough for liquid water for much of its past (6–11). However, a vital question remains: How much water could early Venus have had, and when?

Recent modeling of Venus's magma ocean evolution and subsequent geodynamic and atmospheric evolution suggests that Venus may have retained sufficient water late enough in its history to form an ocean hundreds of meters deep, either through outgassing H_2O from volcanoes or cooling a steam atmosphere (12). Even with modest water inventories of 10 m GEL (Global Equivalent Layer), it has been proposed that habitable conditions on Venus might have persisted until as recently as 0.7 Ga, provided that the planet had a thinner (less than 10-bar) atmosphere, a slow rotation rate, and reflective cloud cover (7, 8).

If a liquid water layer persisted beyond the first few hundred million years of Venus's evolution, it may have left an imprint on Venus's modern atmosphere. This can be used to constrain the maximum thickness of a liquid water layer on Venus. The high deuterium to hydrogen ratio—150 times higher than Earth's (13)—in Venus's atmosphere has been proposed to suggest escape of up to an Earth ocean of water (around 3,000 m GEL) from Venus (14, 15). However, the interpretation of atmospheric D/H remains ambiguous. An Earth ocean of water could have taken anywhere from 4 Gyr to 0.5 Gyr to escape and remain consistent with D/H measurements (16). This range arises from the range of possible hydrogen escape efficiencies and as much as a factor of 20 variability in the D/H fractionation factor over Venus's history (16). Additionally, the water need

Significance

Venus's modern climate is uninhabitable, but early Venus could have sustained surface liquid water for billions of years. Any water present on Venus's surface would have since broken apart into H and O in the atmosphere due to UV radiation, allowing H to escape to space and leaving oxygen behind. Matching Venus's atmospheric composition today after a hypothetical habitable era requires a delicate balance between oxygen sources and loss of oxygen to space and chemical reactions. We find that only a narrow range of conditions enable Venus to have had a habitable era and still evolve to its modern state. Our results suggest that Venus has been uninhabitable for over 70% of its history, four times longer than some previous estimates.

Author affiliations: ^a Department of Geophysical Sciences, University of Chicago, Chicago, IL 60637

Author contributions: A.O.W. designed research; A.O.W. performed research; A.O.W. analyzed data; and A.O.W. and E.S.K. wrote the paper.

The authors declare no competing interest.

This article is a PNAS Direct Submission.

Copyright © 2023 the Author(s). Published by PNAS. This article is distributed under Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives License 4.0 (CC BY-NC-ND).

¹To whom correspondence may be addressed. Email: aowarren@uchicago.edu.

This article contains supporting information online at http://www.pnas.org/lookup/suppl/doi:10.1073/pnas. 2209751120/-/DCSupplemental.

Published March 6, 2023.

not be sourced from an early ocean on Venus. A similar D/H ratio can be produced both by steady-state loss of water delivered over time, for example, by degassing from a fractionated mantle source, through Raleigh fractionation of catastrophic recent water degassing, or through loss of water delivered by impacts (17, 18). Additionally, the initial D/H ratio of Venus may have been higher than for Earth and Mars as a result of its impact history (19) or been modified by loss of H prior to condensation of water on Venus's surface during an early magma ocean period (20). Therefore, although D/H is a useful constraint on the total loss of water from Venus, it is difficult to unpick the effects of Venus's formation and earliest evolution from later H_2O losses from a hypothetical habitable era with surface liquid water.

Fortunately, Venus's atmosphere also records the history of water on the planet through the concentration of atmospheric O (12, 21). Any water in Venus's upper atmosphere is vulnerable to photodissociation to H and O (22). H escapes to space at a higher rate than O, leading to accumulation of O (23). O can then be lost through later nonthermal escape (15, 21), oxidation of reduced atmospheric species such as CO and CH₄ released by volcanoes, and by oxidation of surface rocks (24). Crucial constraints are that Venus's present-day atmosphere is exceedingly O2 and COpoor (<70 ppm O₂, <50 ppm CO) and dry (<100 ppm H₂O) (25, 26). Therefore, if Venus ever had oceans, the O added to the atmosphere by the subsequent evaporation of this water during a moist or runaway greenhouse (RGH) period must since have been removed by oxygen sinks (12, 21). In principle, this places an upper limit on the surface water inventory of any habitable period on Venus-i.e., whether or not Venus once had oceansand also constrains the timing of any possible habitable periods in order to allow time for O sinks to remove essentially all of the O.

Here, we present a time-dependent, mass-balance model of the evolution of Venus's atmospheric composition starting from the end of a hypothetical "habitable era," which we define here as a period able to maintain surface liquid water (Fig. 1; Materials and Methods). Previous work has considered Venus's overall evolution from an initial magma ocean phase to explore whether condensation of surface liquid water and consistency with Venus's modern atmosphere are possible (12), but our approach specifically focuses on the consequences of a hypothetical habitable era for Venus's later evolution. As a result, our models are agnostic to Venus's formation, initial composition, magma ocean evolution, and the details of the habitable era itself. Our O2 loss model tracks the post-habitable-era evolution of H₂O, CO₂, and O₂ in Venus's atmosphere. We assume that all surface liquid water present immediately before the end of habitability enters the atmosphere, either during a runaway greenhouse (RGH) phase or a moist greenhouse phase, both of which could be triggered by the Sun brightening over time, or the outgassing of CO₂ through volcanism. We identify regions of parameter space using a regular grid of seven parameters where the water (and therefore oxygen) added to Venus's atmosphere by the evaporation of habitable era surface liquid water and subsequent volcanic H₂O outgassing can be removed by (Fig. 1):

- 1. Nonthermal O escape
- 2. Oxidation of degassed CO and CH₄ to CO₂
- 3. Oxidation of lava, ash, and magma.

Model runs are considered successful when the final atmospheric O_2 , H_2O , and CO concentrations satisfy the upper limits on O_2 , H_2O , and CO concentrations in Venus's modern atmosphere (26). We consider hypothetical habitable eras ending



Fig. 1. Schematic illustration of our model for Venus's atmospheric evolution starting from the end of a hypothetical early habitable era. Prior to the model start, we set the total end-habitable-era water inventory (Table 1). After the end of the habitable era, the following processes occur: 1) Additional volatiles are added to the atmosphere by volcanism. These volatiles are sourced from H and C species dissolved in the melt, and their speciation into H₂O, H₂, CO₂, CO, and CH₄ is set by the oxygen fugacity of the erupting melt. 2) Water from volcanism and the early habitable era photodissociates to form H and O₂. 3) H escapes to space (purple arrow). 4) O is removed from the atmosphere by escape to space, oxidation of reduced atmospheric species such as H₂, CH₄, and CO to form H₂O and CO₂, and oxidation of Fo in volcanic products (teal arrows). In models where the habitable era ends in a runaway greenhouse (RGH), O can also be removed from the atmosphere by oxidation of a molten basalt layer if the surface temperature exceeds the basalt solidus.

at 4.0, 3.0, and 1.5 Ga, with end-habitable-era water inventories between 10 and 1,000 m GEL over a total of 94,080 model runs (parameters in Table 1; 47,040 runs each for the moist greenhouse case and the RGH case where oxidation of a molten surface occurs).

Two important processes in our O2 loss model are the oxidation of degassed C and H species and oxidation of basalt lava flows. These processes both depend on Venus's crustal production and degassing history, which is constrained by the modern abundance of ⁴⁰Ar in Venus's atmosphere. This is because ⁴⁰Ar is produced by the decay of ⁴⁰K in the crust and in the mantle, and ⁴⁰Ar can be released from the mantle to the atmosphere through degassing from volcanic eruptions and intrusions. ⁴⁰Ar formed from ⁴⁰K decay in the crust can diffuse through the crust into the atmosphere (27, 28). As little as 24% of the radiogenic ⁴⁰Ar in Venus's mantle has been degassed (27), assuming an Earth-like K abundance on Venus. We construct a simple ⁴⁰Ar degassing model following (27, 28) to determine whether the 40 Ar degassed by the crustal production histories used in our O_2 loss model falls within or below the $(1.61 \pm 0.54) \times 10^{16}$ kg range for ⁴⁰Ar abundance in Venus's modern atmosphere (28).

1. Results

A. O_2 Loss Model. Our baseline O_2 loss model considers three oxygen sinks (Fig. 1):

- 1. Escape to space
- 2. Oxidation of reduced atmospheric species (CO, CH₄, and H₂) from degassing
- 3. Oxidation of basaltic lava flows and ash.

Results for our baseline model show that these combined oxygen sinks are able to remove enough O_2 to make end-habitable-era water inventories of up to 300 m GEL ($\lesssim 10\%$ of an Earth Ocean)

Symbol	Description	Values	Units
<i>t</i> ₀	End of the habitable era (and model start time) in Gyr before present	4 (habitable for \leq 0.5Gyr) 3 (habitable for \leq 1.5 Gyr) 1.5 (habitable for $<$ 3 Gyr)	Gyr
h _{hab}	Global Equivalent Layer (GEL) water released into the atmosphere at the end of the habitable era (includes surface water, groundwater, and any water from minerals dehydrated during transition out of habitable conditions)	10, 50, 100, 300, 500, 700, 1,000	m
с _{со2}	Concentration of CO ₂ in Venusian basaltic melts	0.03, 0.05, 0.1, 0.2	wt%
C _{H2} 0	Concentration of H_2O in Venusian basaltic melts	0.001, 0.1, 0.2, 0.5, 700, 1,000	wt%
f _{volc}	Fraction of CO ₂ in Venus's present atmosphere derived from post-habitable era volcanic degassing	0.1, 0.5, 0.9, 1.0	
fext	Fraction of magmatism that is extrusive (reaches the surface as ash or lava rather than crystallizing deep underground)	0.1, 0.3, 0.9, 1.0	
log fO ₂	Oxygen fugacity of erupting melt relative to the fayalite-magnetite- quartz buffer	0, -1, -2, -3, -4	$\log f O_2 \Delta FMQ$

Table 1. Parameter values used in O2 loss model (Materials and Methods for details)

We implement a regular grid approach so all parameter combinations are explored.

consistent with Venus' present atmosphere (Fig. 2). This volume of water would be readily supplied during Venus's formation, with estimates for Venus's initial water inventory ranging from around 0.5 to 5 Earth Oceans (29, 30). The upper limit results from larger end-habitable-era water inventories contributing more O₂ to Venus's atmosphere than can be accommodated by the combined oxygen sinks in our model. The most important sinks are oxidation of reduced atmospheric species and oxidation of lava/ash. The relative contributions of these sinks to O₂ removal depend on the oxygen fugacity of erupting melts on Venus and the melt CO₂ and H₂O concentrations, which determine the speciation of degassed volatiles. For higher oxygen fugacities (e.g., log $fO_2 = FMQ \pm 0$, where FMQ is the fayalite– magnetite–quartz buffer), oxidation of lava/ash is the largest oxygen sink because less CO and CH₄ are degassed. As melt oxygen fugacity decreases and CO/CH₄ degassing increases, oxidation of CO/CH₄ becomes the primary O₂ sink. However, it is difficult for oxidation of CO/CH₄ to exactly balance O₂ introduced by end-habitable-era water inventories. Ongoing H₂O degassing is required in these runs to provide a continuous supply of O₂ and prevent Venus' atmosphere from becoming too CO-rich to satisfy modern CO constraints.

An exception to this 300-m-GEL upper limit is if average melts on Venus have very reduced oxygen fugacities comparable to the most reduced Mars meteorite ($\log f O_2 = FMQ-4$, Fig. 3). Models of mantle oxygen fugacities resulting from a magma ocean suggest that Earth and Venus-sized worlds will have more oxidized upper mantles (31), and Earth's upper mantle has an



Fig. 2. Example model output: Melts with lower oxygen fugacity can enable larger end-habitable-era water inventories to be compatible with modern atmospheric composition; however, melts with low oxygen fugacities also outgas reduced gasses such as CO which can overwhelm the O_2 available to oxidize them and produce an atmosphere with far greater CO than observed on modern Venus. Time evolution of column masses of $i O_2$ and ii C species for different melt oxygen fugacities in a. our baseline model, with all early habitable eras ending with 300 m GEL 4.0 Ga ago and b. with 1000m GEL RGH surface melting. Line colors indicate melt oxygen fugacity. In *ii*, CO₂, CO, and CH₄ are indicated with solid, dashed, and dotted lines, respectively. Black dashed horizontal lines show upper limits for modern Venus O_2 (<70 ppm) and CO (<52 ppm) in *i* and *ii*, respectively (26). Only models that fall beneath both of these limits are considered successful.



Fig. 3. Example model output: Time evolution of column masses of $i H_2O$ (purple) and $ii O_2$ (teal) for (A) our baseline model, with all early habitable eras ending with 100 m GEL 4.0 Ga ago, and (B) with RGH surface melting, showing all habitable eras ending with 500 m GEL at 4.0 Ga. Where red CO₂ curve is flat, surface is molten and volcanism does not occur. Runs are shown as translucent lines. Solid lines illustrate cases where atmospheric evolution is compatible with modern atmospheric H₂O and O₂. Dashed purple lines show upper limits for modern Venus H₂O, and dashed teal lines show upper limits for O₂. Adding runaway greenhouse (RGH) surface melting to our models enables slightly larger end-habitable-era water inventories to be compatible with modern atmospheric H₂O and O₂.

oxygen fugacity around $\log fO_2 = FMQ \pm 0$ (32). However, mantle oxygen fugacities as low as $\log fO_2 = FMQ-4$ have previously been proposed (12). For the $\log fO_2 = FMQ-4$, end-habitable-era water inventories as large as 1,000 m GEL (\sim 33% of an Earth ocean) remain consistent with Venus's modern atmosphere in our models, provided that melt H₂O



Fig. 4. Percentage of model runs that end with atmospheric H₂O, O₂, and CO concentrations consistent with data for modern Venus (25) for different combinations of parameters (Table 1) for runs without runaway greenhouse (RGH) surface melting. Contour plots show model success rates for combinations of different values of 2 parameters. Dashed and solid white lines indicate 2σ and 1σ levels, respectively. Summary bar charts show model success rates for different values of a single parameter. f_{ext} is the extrusive magmatism fraction, f_{volc} is the fraction of Venus's modern atmospheric CO₂ derived from post-habitable era volcanic degassing, and $\log fO_2 \Delta FMQ$ is the oxygen fugacity of erupting melts since the end of the habitable era relative to the fayalite-magnetite-quartz buffer.

concentration is >0.2 wt%. Model runs with 10-m-GEL endhabitable-era water—an ocean three hundred times shallower than Earth's—can evolve to be at or below Venus's presentday atmospheric O₂ levels for 5% of 10 m GEL runs overall; (Figs. 2*A*, 4*A*, and 5). A 10-m-GEL end-habitable-era water inventory is the only case for which low modern atmospheric O₂ concentrations can be matched by habitable eras ending as late as 1.5 Ga.

When $\log fO_2 \ge FMQ-3$, 300-m-GEL end-habitable-era water inventories are compatible only with Venus's modern atmosphere in runs where the habitable era ends early, at or before 3.0 Ga (Fig. 4 and *SI Appendix*, Fig. S1). In runs with habitable eras that end early in Venus's history, the Sun's X-ray/extreme ultraviolet (XUV) flux is high and can drive rapid H escape causing rapid buildup of O₂ in the atmosphere. This is advantageous because the volcanism rate decreases exponentially



Fig. 5. Comparison of fraction of successful runs (runs that have final atmospheric O₂, H₂O, and CO concentrations less than upper limits for Venus's present atmosphere) compatible with modern Venus atmosphere for models without runaway greenhouse (RGH) melting (dark blue) and with RGH melting (dark green). Successful runs that also fall within or below the range of Venus's modern atmospheric ⁴⁰Ar abundance are also shown for models with (light blue) and without (light green) RGH. All parameter values correspond to Table 1.

with time in our models, so oxidizable basalt—which can be a major oxygen sink—is most available soon after the end of the habitable era. An early end to the habitable era allows basalt oxidation to sequester the most O_2 , as O_2 is available to be removed at the time of eruption.

When we add RGH surface melting to our baseline O₂ loss model, end-habitable-era water inventories \geq 300 m GEL permit surface temperatures hot enough to melt basalt, enabling rapid diffusion of oxygen into a basaltic surface magma layer. This RGH is caused by vaporization of the end-habitable-era water inventory and is distinct from a steam atmosphere formed during accretion (33). The surface magma layer provides an additional O₂ sink as long as the H₂O greenhouse effect melts surface basalt (34). However, adding this additional O sink only increases the total number of successful O₂ loss model runs from 2.2% to 2.6% (Figs. 2*B*, 4*B* and 5).

This is because:

- In runs with large water inventories but little initial atmospheric CO₂, the surface magma layer is short lived because H₂O loss rapidly reduces the greenhouse effect. This leads to a short-lived and thin surface magma layer that consumes only remove a small amount of O₂.
- 2. In runs with large water inventories and a large fraction of Venus's modern atmospheric CO_2 degassed prior to the end of the habitable era, H loss is slow because it must diffuse through a thick background atmosphere. This extends the lifetime of the oxidizable magma layer but delays accumulation of atmospheric CO_2 because we do not include volcanic outgassing while the surface is molten. For habitable eras ending at 4.0 and 3.0 Ga, the surface magma layer can persist so long that it is no longer possible for all of Venus's present-day CO_2 to volcanically degas after the surface of the magma layer freezes.
- 3. For habitable eras ending at 1.5 Ga and water inventories of 1,000 m GEL, the increase in bolometric insolation and decrease in H loss rates due to the Sun's reduced XUV output (35) enable a H₂O greenhouse with a surface magma layer to last until the present, which is inconsistent with data.
- 4. In runs with reducing melts, removal of atmospheric O_2 leftover from H escape of the end-habitable-era water inventory can remove so much O_2 from the atmosphere that there is no longer enough oxidizing power available to oxidize degassed CO and CH₄ fully to CO₂, leading to final atmospheric CO concentrations too high to match Venus's modern atmosphere.

B. ⁴⁰Ar Degassing Model. Oxidation of the degassed atmospheric species CO and CH₄ and oxidation of lava flows are the most important oxygen sinks in our baseline model. During degassing and volcanism, minor atmospheric constituents such as ⁴⁰Ar are released into the atmosphere alongside major C and H species and can be used to place constraints on the total crustal production on Venus (27, 28). We model the ⁴⁰Ar degassing corresponding to the crustal production histories used in our O₂ loss models.

Overall, $\lesssim 0.4\%$ of runs are consistent with Venus's presentday atmospheric O₂ and ⁴⁰Ar for the parameter ranges investigated in this study. To match modern Venus's low atmospheric ⁴⁰Ar, our ⁴⁰Ar degassing model requires parameters that minimize the total production of new crust (Fig. 5 and *SI Appendix*, Fig. S4). High melt fractions reduce the concentration of ⁴⁰K and ⁴⁰Ar in mantle-derived melts, reducing the amount of ⁴⁰Ar degassed directly to the atmosphere during volcanism and the amount of ⁴⁰K available in the crust to decay and also supply ⁴⁰Ar to the atmosphere. Thin crust promotes rapid recycling of ⁴⁰K-enriched crust back into the mantle, reducing the amount of time available for crustal ⁴⁰K to decay and release ⁴⁰Ar to the atmosphere through the crust for a given crustal production rate. Low values of *fvolc*—which correspond to most of Venus's modern CO₂ degassing before the end of a hypothetical habitable era—reduce the total amount of CO2 that needs to be degassed during the model runs, which in turn reduces the necessary crustal production and the total amount of mantle melting and degassing required to achieve Venus's modern CO₂ atmosphere. This is advantageous for satisfying the ⁴⁰Ar constraint because earlier degassing leaves less time for ⁴⁰K to decay, so the atmosphere by the end of the habitable era can have abundant CO₂ but still be ⁴⁰Ar poor. However, reducing the total crustal production (advantageous for matching the ⁴⁰Ar constraint) reduces the size of the basalt lava flow oxidation and degassed reduced species O2 sinks.

Together, these factors make it more difficult to reconcile a hypothetical early habitable era with data for modern Venus and narrow the range of parameters that reconcile a hypothetical habitable era with measurements of Venus's modern atmosphere. Within the framework of our model, only a small loophole in parameter space, corresponding to less than 0.4 % of model runs, remains when the ⁴⁰Ar and oxygen constraints are combined (light blue and light green columns in Fig. 5):

- 1. The habitable era must end prior to 3 Ga: In our models, volcanism is required to supply fresh basalt and reduced gases (particularly CO and CH₄) to Venus's surface and atmosphere to act as an oxygen sink. The later in Venus's history this volcanic activity occurs, the longer mantle ⁴⁰K has to decay into ⁴⁰Ar, which is then degassed during volcanism. Extensive ⁴⁰Ar degassing in runs violates the observed low ⁴⁰Ar in Venus's modern atmosphere. Therefore, within the framework of our model, Venus must have been uninhabitable for at least ~70% of its history, >4 times as long as some previous estimates (8).
- 2. The end-habitable-era water inventory must be $\leq 300 \text{ m GEL}$, unless melt oxygen fugacity $\log fO_2$ less than FMQ-3: For more oxidized average melts on Venus, oxygen sinks in our model can remove only the O left behind by H escape from 300 m GEL of water at the end of a habitable era. When erupted melts have lower oxygen fugacities, the corresponding increase in degassed CO and CH₄ can remove an additional 500 m GEL or more. Therefore, within the framework of our model, if Venusian melts have similar oxygen fugacity to mid-ocean ridge (MOR) melts on Earth, i.e., $\log fO_2 \approx FMQ \pm 4$ (32), Venus's oceans were shallow by the end of the habitable era.
- 3. Average melts erupted on Venus after the habitable era must have had ≥ 0.2 wt% dissolved H₂O, unless Venus melts have high oxygen fugacities: Oxidation of degassed CO and CH₄ is a major O₂ sink in our baseline model. Degassing of reduced species continues after all O₂ is consumed. As a result, degassing of CO and CH₄ often exceeds the O₂ reduction sink. Continued H₂O degassing through Venus's post-habitable history provides a supply of O₂ as H escapes to space to balance continued CO and CH₄ degassing. A given model run typically behaves in one of two ways: 1. Venus's post-habitable evolution does not have sufficient O₂ sinks to remove O₂ from the atmosphere to match modern

constraints. 2. Once O_2 from a large end-habitable-era water inventory is depleted in a run with larger cumulative O_2 sinks caused by either a surface melt layer during a runaway greenhouse or abundant extrusive volcanism, the O_2 available to oxidize CO and CH₄ to CO₂ has been used up, and degassed CO accumulates rapidly in the atmosphere. In other words, exactly matching the reducing capacity of the Venus surface–atmosphere system to the oxygen introduced by loss of an end-habitable-era H₂O inventory and degassed water requires fine-tuning.

Only ~10% of our 57,600 total ⁴⁰Ar degassing model runs (independent of our oxygen loss runs) fall within or below the measured range for Venus's modern atmospheric ⁴⁰Ar abundance. However, many of the ⁴⁰Ar degassing runs that can reproduce Venus's modern ⁴⁰Ar abundance have parameter combinations that cannot reproduce Venus's modern O₂, H₂O, and CO concentrations in our O₂ loss model. This reduces the proportion of our O₂ loss runs that are consistent with Venus's present-day atmosphere when both oxygen and ⁴⁰Ar are considered to be less than 0.4% (Fig. 5).

2. Discussion

A. Evolution of Habitable Era Surface Water Inventory. Our models place an upper limit of 500 m GEL on the total water inventory supplied to the atmosphere at the end of a hypothetical habitable era on Venus, unless Venus's eruptive history has been dominated by melts with an oxygen fugacity of $\log f O_2$ less than FMQ-3 in which case the end-habitable era inventory can extend to 1,000 m. Our O_2 loss model constrains only the final water inventory before conditions transitioned from habitable to uninhabitable. However, the surface water inventory during a hypothetical habitable era need not be constant. To quantify the evolution of a hypothetical habitable era's water inventory over time, we model the hydration of crust and the recycling of hydrated crust into the mantle.

We constructed a steady-state 1-D model (Materials and Methods) of the simplest possible case where Venus's crust is recycled in a vertical conveyor belt-like fashion (36, 37). New lava erupted at the surface buries older crust, which will eventually subside into the convecting mantle (36). For a given lithospheric thickness and eruption rate (which we assume to be constant throughout the habitable era for this exercise), we find the geotherm through the lithosphere (38, 39). We compare this geotherm to phase boundaries for eclogite formation (40) and serpentinite dehydration (41). When dense eclogite forms, the crust is more likely to sink into the mantle (37). Where the geotherm encounters the eclogite stability field before serpentine dehydrates, we assume that the hydrated lithosphere returns water to the mantle through entrainment in convection (42). When the geotherm crosses into the serpentinite dehydration field first, water is returned to the surface or shallow crustal reservoirs and not into the mantle. We investigate a range of internal radiogenic heating rates comparable to those observed in modern terrestrial basalts (43). Higher internal radiogenic heating rates (e.g., adjusted for a younger planet with a higher concentration of decaying radioactive elements) generate geotherms with crusts thinner than 5 km, which is the lowest crustal thickness we consider in this model based on the range estimated for modern Venus (44). These thin, hot crusts do not pass through the eclogite stability field and, therefore, do not lead to recycling of hydrated crust into the mantle within the framework of our

model. Lithospheres thicker than 100 km with internal heating rates less than 5 μ W m⁻³ (*SI Appendix*, Fig. S5) are able to form eclogite before serpentinite dehydration occurs.

Next, we model the time-evolving surface water inventory during a hypothetical habitable era on Venus (*Materials and Methods*) only for the cases where water recycling into the mantle is able to occur, starting from inventories as large as 3,000 m GEL, or 1 Earth ocean. At each timestep, we use Venus's presentday topography to approximate the corresponding proportion of Venus's surface that would be submerged. Submerged areas of the surface are permitted to form a hydrated crust (0.1 to 3 wt% H₂O) (12, 45), with lithospheric recycling occurring at the same rate as crustal production. To maximize the water removed from the surface inventory, which maximizes the peak depth of a hypothetical ocean on early Venus, we assume that all crustal production occurs as extrusive volcanism. We also track H₂O release by volcanic degassing (*Materials and Methods*).

In some cases, the surface water inventory approaches a steady state where removal by burial of hydrated crust (occurring at a rate set by the surface water inventory and crustal production rate) matches water inputs by volcanic degassing. Models with low ($\leq 0.2 \text{ wt\%}$) melt H₂O concentrations do not reach a steady state and instead lose all of their water (*SI Appendix*, Figs. S7 and S8).

In order for a habitable era with an evolving surface water inventory to be compatible with our O2 loss and ⁴⁰Ar degassing model results, the surface water inventory by the end of the habitable era must be below 500 m GEL (Fig. 5). This is favored by melt H₂O concentrations between 0.1 and 0.7 wt% and high mass fractions (≥ 0.5 wt%) of water in hydrated crust (SI Appendix, Figs. S7 and S8). For cases where the final water inventory drops below 500 m GEL, the average surface water inventory over the course of the habitable era can be up to half an order of magnitude greater than the final water inventory for a few combinations of crust hydration and melt H₂O concentration, allowing for much deeper oceans on early Venus in some cases. However, this mechanism for net sequestration of water in the mantle through burial of hydrated crust does not affect the conclusion that only hypothetical habitable eras that ended prior to 3 Ga are consistent with ⁴⁰Ar, O₂, H₂O, and CO concentrations in Venus's modern atmosphere (26, 28).

B. Limitations. The paucity of existing data for modern Venus severely restricts our understanding of Venus's past. This is one of the primary drivers for Venus exploration over the coming decades. It is currently unknown whether Venus has ongoing volcanism, what the planet's tectonic regime is, how thick the crust and lithosphere are, what the mantle composition is—let alone how all of these important factors have evolved over the past 4 Gyr (46). As a result, our treatment of Venus's post-habitable evolution in both our oxygen loss and Ar degassing models is highly simplified.

First, to enable modeling with the least number of assumptions about Venus's interior, we have assumed that the composition of melts erupting on Venus does not change over time. Thus, we model "average" melts on Venus. Eruptions resulting from mantle plumes (46) or local magmatic systems may have different volatile concentrations.

Second, we do not include degassing of S to reduce the number of parameters needed to describe melt compositions and degassing. Although this has a negligible impact on the speciation of the gasses included in our model (47), Venus's modern atmosphere contains SO₂, SO, and other S species.

This requires that Venus has recently degassed—and may still be degassing—S in some form (48). It follows that oxidation of S species may have acted as an O_2 sink analogous to the way oxidation of CO to CO_2 is an important mechanism for removing atmospheric O_2 in our model.

Third, our approach to modeling surface melting during a runaway greenhouse is highly simplified. To maximize the potential oxygen sink, we assume that diffusion of oxygen into the melt does not limit the rate at which the melt oxidizes such that all molten material at a given timestep is available to oxidize. Our approach also neglects the greenhouse effect of CO₂. CO₂ contributes around 420 K of greenhouse warming to Venus's modern atmosphere (49), which is not sufficient to melt Venus's surface under the bright modern Sun, and much less than the maximum greenhouse warming possible under the same insolation with H₂O (34). Additionally, the absorption bands for CO₂ and H₂O overlap, so their greenhouse effects are not additive (50). Our modeling approach focuses on the feedback between the much stronger H₂O greenhouse effect and H escape to space; however, this may underestimate the surface temperature at a given timestep, which could extend the duration of the runaway greenhouse melting stage and lead to greater O₂ loss.

Fourth, we assume that Venus's eruptive history can be modeled as an exponential decay between the end of the habitable era and the present day. The crater retention age of Venus's surface suggests that the planet has been resurfaced geologically recently (51, 52). This crater retention age can be explained by either a catastrophic resurfacing event 0.3 to 1 Gyr ago (53) or equilibrium resurfacing by continuous volcanism (54). We opt for continuous volcanism in our models because this maximizes the lava flow oxidation oxygen sink by erupting fresh lava, rather than having surface oxidation limited by diffusion. This, in turn, maximizes the end-habitable-era water inventory possible in our models, which is conservative relative to our conclusion that only a narrow range of parameters is consistent with Early Venus habitability. Differences in Venus's crustal production history will not change our fundamental conclusion that the reducing power introduced to Venus's surface-atmosphere system by nonthermal O escape, eruption of lava flows containing minerals that can be oxidized, and degassing of gasses such as CO and CH₄ must balance the total O₂ introduced by H escape from an end-habitable-era water inventory and any subsequently degassed H₂O in order to reconcile a past habitable era with Venus's modern atmosphere. However, differences in Venus's crustal production history are important for ⁴⁰Ar degassing. Our approach is also conservative with respect to ⁴⁰Ar degassing because degassing is greatest earlier in our models, reducing the time for ⁴⁰K decay to make ⁴⁰Ar available in the mantle for release by volcanism.

Fifth, our ⁴⁰Ar degassing model is based on a large number of poorly constrained parameters (*SI Appendix*, Table S2) and requires assumptions about Venus's tectonic regime and prehabitable era evolution. There are several potential ways to reduce ⁴⁰Ar degassing over Venus's history that could make a larger proportion of our model results consistent with Venus's modern atmospheric composition. For example, the concentration of radioactive isotopes in Venus's mantle is poorly constrained (27). A lower concentration of U and K in Venus's mantle would reduce the accumulation of ⁴⁰Ar in the mantle and therefore ⁴⁰Ar degassing over time. Additionally, ⁴⁰Ar may not be distributed homogeneously through Venus's mantle. If Venus has mantle reservoirs enriched in incompatible elements or a thick basal magam occan (55), ⁴⁰Ar may be prevented from degassing to the atmosphere, increasing the number of our model runs compatible with Venus's modern atmospheric ⁴⁰Ar concentration.

C. Implications for Upcoming Venus Missions. Our model results suggest, in agreement with previous results (12), that a habitable era on Venus with abundant surface liquid water was unlikely and suggest a number of tests for upcoming Venus missions: VERITAS (Venus Emissivity, Radio science, InSAR, Topography, And Spectroscopy), DAVINCI (Deep Atmosphere Venus Investigation of Noble gases, Chemistry, and Imaging), and EnVision.

For example, VERITAS high-resolution topography and gravity data could be used to better constrain Venus's present lithospheric thickness. At present, this parameter is not well enough constrained to distinguish between a range of possible tectonic regimes. Our results favor a tectonic regime with limited volcanism over the past 4 Gyr to reconcile any early habitable era with Venus's modern atmosphere. Determining Venus's modern (or recent) tectonic regime and lithospheric thickness is also important for better constraining ⁴⁰Ar degassing models, by providing constraints on the recycling depth of ⁴⁰K-enriched crust.

Both VERITAS and DAVINCI will survey high SiO₂ rocks on Venus's surface. If these rocks resemble terrestrial andesites and rhyolites, this could imply H_2O in the melting zone and suggest high melt H_2O concentrations consistent with our successful model runs (56, 57). However, hydrous melting will need to be distinguished from anhydrous fractional crystallization processes, which can also produce silicic magmas (57).

VERITAS also plans to measure FeO abundance. This can be used to narrow down the range of likely melting conditions and extent of fractional crystallization on Venus (58), which also constrain melt volatile concentrations. Crustal FeO abundance can also be used to refine the estimate of the FeO concentration in Venusian basalts used in our models. If Venus's FeO is very high, this will increase the oxidizing potential per unit volume of lava, thus potentially driving our results toward higher required melt H_2O concentrations to compensate for greater loss of atmospheric O_2 to oxidizing Venus's basaltic surface while atmospheric O_2 is greatest early in Venus's post-habitable evolution.

3. Conclusions

Nonthermal O escape to space, oxidation of basaltic lava flows, and oxidation of degassed CO and CH4 can remove oxygen from up to 300 m GEL on the total water inventory supplied to the atmosphere at the end of a hypothetical habitable era on Venus, unless Venus's eruptive history has been dominated by melts with an oxygen fugacity of $\log f O_2$ less than FMQ-3 Earth MORB is around $\log fO_2$ = FMQ \pm 0 (32), in which case the endhabitable era inventory can extend to 1,000 m. The oxidation of a transient layer of basaltic melt during an end-habitable-era runaway greenhouse (RGH) can remove oxygen corresponding to an additional 200 m GEL of water (Figs. 4 and 5), raising the limit to 500 m GEL for Venus histories with melt oxygen fugacities $\log fO_2 \ge FMQ-3$. Although these results reconcile a potential early habitable era on Venus with the paucity of O₂ in Venus's modern atmosphere, only 2.6% of parameter combinations in our models lead to post-habitable era outcomes that satisfy atmospheric abundance data for modern Venus. These successful runs define a narrow loophole in parameter space where the reducing power of the Venus surface-atmosphere system since the end of a habitable era is able to balance the O2

introduced by the escape of H from end-habitable-era water and degassed $\mathrm{H}_2\mathrm{O}.$

This loophole becomes even smaller when additional constraints on Venus's history are taken into consideration. The two most important oxygen sinks in our models are oxidation of degassed CO and CH₄ and oxidation of basaltic lava flows, both of which require volcanism and degassing on Venus since the end of a hypothetical habitable era. Degassing and volcanism due to crustal production on Venus lead to degassing of ⁴⁰Ar. When the ⁴⁰Ar contributions to the atmosphere caused by the eruption of lava flows and degassing needed to remove oxygen from Venus's atmosphere through oxidation of basaltic volcanic products and reduced gasses like CO and CH₄ are taken into account, only models with habitable eras ending before 3.0 Ga are consistent with ⁴⁰Ar, O₂, H₂O, and CO measurements of Venus's modern atmosphere (Fig. 5), reducing the success rate of our models to less than 0.4% of model runs.

Although our modeling results demonstrate that Venus must have had less than 500 m GEL water by around 4 Ga unless Venus's average melts had oxygen fugacities comparable to that of the most reduced Martian meteorite, we also find that the time-averaged water inventory on an early habitable Venus may have been much greater than this upper limit. Efficient recycling of hydrated basaltic crust into the mantle through eclogite formation (40) might act to reduce Venus's surface water inventory during a habitable era. A 1-D model of this process suggests that habitable era averaged water inventories up to 1,000 m GEL could be consistent with our O₂ loss and ⁴⁰Ar degassing modeling results even for melts with higher oxygen fugacities (*SI Appendix*, Figs. S7 and S8), provided that Venus had a lithosphere greater than 100 km thick with internal radiogenic heat production rates less than 5 μ W m⁻³ (*SI Appendix*, Fig. S6).

Key measurements for the VERITAS, DAVINCI, and EnVision missions that would help further evaluate the likelihood of a past habitable era (based on our modeling results) are lithospheric thickness and crustal SiO₂ and FeO abundances. For example, if hydrous melting is found to have been a significant process on Venus, this would support the existence of a past habitable era on Venus because our results suggest that high average melt H₂O concentrations are an important factor for preventing accumulation of abundant CO in Venus's atmosphere.

Materials and Methods

We combine simple models of degassing of basaltic melts (59), atmospheric escape of H and O, and removal of O from the atmosphere by oxidation of reduced gases, lava flows, and ash (when formed) to track the evolution of Venus's atmospheric composition since the end of an early habitable period using a 4th-order Runge-Kutte integration scheme. To identify post-habitable era scenarios that are compatible with Venus's present-day atmospheric composition, we vary seven key parameters in our model (Table 1) with each parameter value weighted equally. All parameter combinations resulting in final atmospheric H₂O, O₂, and CO concentrations below upper limits (25) for Venus's atmosphere are marked as "successes."

A. Initial Conditions. Each model begins at time t_0 , after the end of a hypothetical early habitable era on Venus. The initial column mass of CO₂ is

$$M_{CO_{2},0} = (1 - f_{volc})M_{CO_{2},f},$$
[1]

where f_{volc} (Table 1) is the fraction of CO₂ in Venus's present-day atmosphere from post-habitable era volcanic degassing, and $M_{CO_2,f}$ is the column mass of CO₂ on Venus today. We consider values of f_{volc} greater than 0.1 because we assume that some CO₂ must be degassed after the end of a habitable era due to Venus's young surface age (51, 52). We extend the range to $f_{volc} = 1$ because a habitable atmosphere on Venus may have been CO_2 poor, as Earth's is today. Any CO_2 present at t_0 is assumed to have degassed prior to/during the habitable era, or through metamorphic decarbonation during the transition from habitable to uninhabitable conditions (36, 60, 61).

We also initialize our model with H_2O added to the atmosphere by vaporization of any surface liquid water present during the habitable era (Table 1). We consider water inventories between 10 and 1,000 m GEL. Our lower limit is based on water inventories required to sustain habitable surface temperatures in existing Venus climate model studies (8). The loss of up to 3,000 m GEL of water, or 1 Earth ocean, is one interpretation of Venus's modern D/H ratio (14, 15). We treat the initial atmospheric water in two different ways, corresponding to two different ways that water could have entered Venus's atmosphere during and at the end of a hypothetical habitable era. First, we consider a case where atmospheric water vapor does not lead to surface melting. This corresponds to a moist greenhouse where H is lost to space via a moist stratosphere (62), but the surface remains too cold to melt basalt. For simplicity, we do not explicitly model the time evolution of the moist greenhouse phase and, instead, assume that all H from the starting water inventory has already escaped, leaving behind O₂. Second, we consider a case where greenhouse warming from H₂O vaporized during an RGH causes melting of Venus's surface. We calculate surface temperatures as a function of partial pressure of water vapor in the atmosphere (34). This enables us to quantify the potential importance of oxidation of a surface magma layer as an O₂ sink.

Runaway greenhouse. Post-habitable era surface temperatures on Venus may have exceeded the melting point of rock. For atmospheric water inventories as small as 0.1 Terrestrial Oceans (TO) and a solar flux twice that of present-day Earth, temperatures can exceed 2,000 K (34). Diffusion of oxygen into surface magma could oxidize Fe^{2+} to Fe^{3+} , serving as an O₂ sink. The duration of this O2 sink depends on initial atmospheric water inventory and the combined H escape rate and dissolution of H_2O in the melt. These two processes both deplete atmospheric H₂O vapor, which reduces the surface temperature (the greenhouse effect of O₂ is negligible). We find surface temperature at each timestep, given the incoming solar flux relative to Earth's insolation (S_{eff}) and partial pressure of H₂O in the atmosphere in bars (p_{H_2O}), using an equation fit to existing numerical results (63) (SI Appendix, Oxygen Loss Model and Table S1). We neglect the greenhouse effect of background CO2. The parameters that determine Venus's evolution during RGH melting are t_0 , h_{hab} , f_{volc} , and f_{ext} (Table 1), so for computational efficiency, we model RGH evolution separately until the surface melt layer freezes and then input the results as starting conditions for our baseline model.

To calculate removal of oxygen by oxidation of Fe^{2+} in basaltic melt at the surface, we calculate the temperature-depth profile of a 50-km thick crust at each timestep as the surface temperature evolves using a 1-D finite difference method. In the absence of any constraints on the crustal thickness on early Venus, we choose a maximum crustal thickness of 50 km because this is the thickness of basaltic crust required to remove the oxygen produced by the escape of 1 Earth ocean of water (64), which exceeds the maximum habitable-era water inventory considered in our models. Temperature within the crust evolves by diffusion:

$$\rho c_{p} \frac{\partial T}{\partial t} = \frac{\partial}{\partial z} \left(k \frac{\partial T}{\partial z} \right) - q_{L'}$$
^[2]

where q_L is heat flux due to the latent heat of fusion:

$$q_L = \rho L \frac{\partial z_{melt}}{\partial t},$$
 [3]

where z_{melt} is the effective magma layer thickness produced at each depth in the model. Our upper boundary condition in the model is the surface temperature, which is a function of insolation and water vapor in the atmosphere. We impose a heat flux of 50 mW m⁻² as our lower boundary condition.

As the thickness of the melt layer and the partial pressure of H_2O in the atmosphere evolve, so does the amount of H_2O stored in the melt layer. As H escapes to space and as the melt layer thickens, less H_2O dissolves in the melt because the partial pressure of H_2O is reduced. However, as the melt layer refreezes and partial pressure of H_2O drops, H_2O can also be re-exsolved into the atmosphere. The solubility of H_2O in the runaway greenhouse-triggered

surface melt ($s_{H_2O,RGH}$) at a given timestep is (65):

$$s_{\rm H_20,RGH} = 3.44 \times 10^{-8} P_{\rm H_20}^{0.74}$$

where P_{H_2O} is the partial pressure of H_2O in the atmosphere.

$$P_{\rm H_2O} = \frac{n_{\rm H_2O,atm}}{n_{atm}} p_{atm},$$
 [4]

where $n_{H_2O,atm}$ is the number of moles H_2O per column mass in the atmosphere, n_{atm} is the total number of moles in the atmosphere, and p_{atm} is the total atmospheric pressure. We assume that dissolved H_2O is mixed throughout the melt layer and that the dissolved H_2O content adjusts to match the H_2O solubility. Therefore, the change in atmospheric H_2O at each timestep is given by:

$$\frac{\partial n_{\text{H}_2O,atm}}{\partial t} = -\frac{\rho_{melt}}{m_{\text{H}_2O}} \frac{\partial}{\partial t} \left(s_{\text{H}_2O,\text{RGHZ}melt} \right).$$
[5]

To calculate O_2 losses due to melt oxidation, we compute the melt fraction of a basalt with major element composition given by the Venera 14 surface measurements at a range of temperatures and pressures using alphaMELTS (66–68). We use these model runs to generate a lookup table which we use to find melt fraction as a function of depth at each timestep. We assume that all Fe²⁺ in the melt can be completely oxidized, i.e., that O_2 can pervade the entire magma layer, for example, by small-scale convection. We track both the cumulative melt fraction ($f_{m,c}$) and the cumulative oxidized melt fraction ($f_{o,c}$) at each depth in the model. The oxidized melt fraction at each timestep is given by the following:

$$f_{o,c} = \frac{0.25 f_{m,c} \rho c_{\text{FeO}}}{n_{02,atm}},$$
 [6]

where $n_{O2,atm}$ is the number of moles of O₂ per column atmosphere. The factor of 0.25 accounts for the stoichiometry of Eq. **17**. $f_{o,c}$ at a given depth is not allowed to exceed 1.

B. Atmospheric Escape.

H escape. The bulk composition of Venus's atmosphere evolves throughout our models based on expressions for escape of H from Venus (69) which we use to track the accumulation of O_2 in the atmosphere. H is supplied by photodissociation of H_2O . Following previous work, we assume that the photodissociation rate does not limit H escape (62). Escape of a light species is limited by its ability to diffuse through the background atmosphere of heavier species that are not undergoing escape (23). At high H_2O mixing ratios, H escape approaches the XUV (energy) limit (Eq. **10**). At each timestep in our model, we calculate the diffusion-limited escape and the energy-limited escape of H and apply the lowest of the two.

The diffusion limit determines the maximum supply of the escaping species to the upper atmosphere. In this diffusion-limited case, the rate of atmospheric escape is

$$\dot{M}_{H,esc} = X_H \frac{GM_V(m_{atm} - m_H)}{R^2} \frac{b}{kT_{upper}},$$
[7]

where X_H is the molar mixing ratio of H in the atmosphere, and m_{atm} is the mean molecular weight of the background atmosphere, set by the molar ratio of non-H species after photodissociation has occurred:

$$m_{atm} = X_{\rm CO_2} m_{\rm CO_2} + 2X_{\rm O2} m_0 + X_{\rm CO} m_{\rm CO} + X_{\rm CH_4} m_{\rm CH_4},$$
 [8]

and b is the diffusion coefficient of H in the background atmosphere, which depends on the abundance of other species (12, 69):

$$b_{H,atm} = \frac{b_{\text{H-CO}_2} X_{\text{CO}_2} + b_{\text{H-CO}} X_{\text{CO}} + b_{\text{H-O}} X_0}{X_{\text{CO}_2} + X_{\text{CO}} + X_0},$$
 [9]

 m_{CO_2} , m_{CO} , and m_{O_2} are the mean molar masses of CO₂, CO, and O₂, and X_{CO_2} , X_{CO} , and X_{O_2} are the mixing ratios of CO₂, CO, and O₂. $b_{H-CO_2} = 8.4 \times 10^{19} T_{upper}^{0.6}$, $b_{H-CO} = 6.5 \times 10^{19} T_{upper}^{0.75}$, and $b_{H-O} = 4.8 \times 10^{19} T_{upper}^{0.75}$

are the binary diffusion coefficients of *H* in CO₂, CO, and O, respectively, in mol m⁻¹ s⁻¹ (70, 71). Binary diffusion coefficients are derived from empirical fits to measured data and can deviate from the data by several tens of percent. To quantify the impact of this effect on our results, we conducted sensitivity tests with values of b_{atm} 30% lower and 30% higher than our baseline value and found that the total number of successful runs is not sensitive to \pm 30% variations in the binary diffusion coefficient (*SI Appendix*, Fig. S9). $T_{upper} = 200$ K is the temperature of the upper atmosphere and is assumed constant in our models. We conducted sensitivity tests with values of T_{upper} at 215 K and 170 K to cover warmer, Earth-like upper atmosphere temperatures (12) through to modern Venus's more intensely CO₂-cooled stratosphere (72) and found that the total number of successful runs is not sensitive to these variations in stratospheric temperature (*SI Appendix*, Fig. S10).

We calculate the energy-limited escape rate, given by the mass loss rate of H in a pure H atmosphere, using the following (69, 73):

$$\dot{M}_{H,ref} = \frac{\epsilon L_{XUV}(t)R^3}{4a^2 GM},$$
[10]

 $\epsilon = 0.15$ (69) is an efficiency factor, $L_{XUV}(t)$ is stellar XUV flux at time t, R is planet radius, a is Venus's semimajor axis, G is the gravitational constant, and M is the mass of Venus. To find $L_{XUV}(t)$, we use the following expression for solar XUV evolution, valid for solar age > 0.1 Gyr (35, 73):

$$L_{XUV} = L_X(t/t_X)^{-\beta},$$
[11]

where $t_x = 0.1$ Gyr, $\beta = 1.24$, and $L_x = 1.6 \times 10^{23}$ J s⁻¹ is an upper bound on the Sun's early XUV flux.

For present-day Venus, the diffusion limit gives an H loss rate of order 10^{25} s⁻¹, depending on the mixing ratios of H and O in the resulting atmosphere, which is comparable to calculated modern H escape rates (74). We set $T_{upper} = 200$ K, consistent with a CO₂ dominated atmosphere (15, 75).

High-flux H escape can drag O along with it ref. 23 (*SI Appendix, Oxygen Loss Model*). This process is active during the first few million years of our models with habitable eras beginning at 4.0 Ga but is negligible relative to O loss through nonthermal escape and oxidation of lava flows and magma.

Escape of heavy species. For most of Venus's history, O loss to space has been via nonthermal escape processes. These depend on the XUV flux from the Sun and the properties of the solar wind (15, 21). We use existing studies' (21) calculations of maximum loss of O₂ from Venus's atmosphere as a function of time. As O₂ is a minor constituent of the atmosphere relative to CO₂, we assume that O₂ loss from the upper atmosphere is limited by diffusion through the background atmosphere similar to Eq. 8:

$$m_{atm} = X_{CO_2} m_{CO_2} + X_{H_2O} m_{H_2O} + X_{CO} m_{CO} + X_{CH_4} m_{CH_4} + X_{CO} m_{CO} + X_{H_2} m_{H_2}.$$

In this case, we apply a binary diffusion coefficient (*b*) relevant to the diffusion of O_2 through a mixture of CO_2 and CO (following the same approach as for diffusion of H through the upper atmosphere, Eq. **9**) (71) as these are the dominant constituent of the atmosphere in the majority of our models. As for H escape, we find the nonthermal escape rate and calculate the diffusion limit for O and apply the smallest of the two to O escape in our models. Following other models of the long-term evolution of Venus's atmosphere, we neglect nonthermal losses of CO_2 (15, 76).

C. Degassing. For each model run, we set a melt H_2O and CO_2 concentration $(c_{H_2O} \text{ and } c_{CO_2}, \text{ respectively, Table 1})$, based on the range observed in terrestrial Mid Ocean Ridge Basalts (MORB) (77–80), which have similar bulk compositions to Venus basalts (81). We also set an oxidation state of the erupting melt between the fayalite-magnetite-quartz buffer ($logfO_2 = FMQ \pm 0$) and $logfO_2 = FMQ - 4$. We use VolcGasses (47) to find H_2O and CO_2 solubility in basaltic melt (s_{H_2O} and s_{CO_2} , respectively) and calculate the speciation of the exsolved H and C bearing gasses as a function of melt temperature and surface pressure. This degassing model assumes that bubbles and surrounding melt remain in thermodynamic equilibrium (47). We assume that melts reaching

the surface degas at Venus's time-varying surface pressure and that all intrusive melts are emplaced at a shallow enough depth that all melt CO_2 can degas as CO_2 , CO, or CH_4 .

To calculate the degassing rate of H₂O per unit Venus surface area, we use:

$$\dot{M}_{H_2O,degas} = \dot{z}_{erupt} \rho_{melt} r_{H_2O} (c_{H_2O} - s_{H_2O}),$$
 [12]

where \dot{z}_{erupt} is the eruption rate (in m s⁻¹), ρ_{melt} is the density of the melt, and $r_{\rm H_20} = n_{\rm H_20}/(n_{\rm H_20} + n_{\rm H_2})$ is the molar fraction of H₂O in the melt exsolved as H₂O. When $s_{\rm H_2O} \ge c_{\rm H_2O}$, $\dot{M}_{H_2O,degas} = 0$.

 $\rm CO_2$ solubilities in basaltic melt are much lower than our prescribed melt $\rm CO_2$ concentrations at all pressures, so to calculate the degassing rate of $\rm CO_2$ per unit Venus surface area, we use

$$\dot{M}_{CO_2,degas} = \dot{z}_{erupt} \rho_{melt} r_{CO_2} c_{CO_2},$$
[13]

where $r_{CO_2} = n_{CO_2}/(n_{CO} + n_{CH_4}) + n_{CO_2}$ is the molar fraction of CO₂ in the melt exsolved as CO₂. We also calculate H₂, CO, and CH₄ degassing into the atmosphere at each time step using the same approach but substituting in r_{H2} , r_{CO} , and r_{CH4} as appropriate. After degassing, these species are oxidized by atmospheric O₂ (if present) to form H₂O and CO₂. If there are fewer moles of atmospheric O₂ in the atmosphere than would be needed to fully oxidize CO and CH₄, we assume that all the CO and CH₄ remaining after the O₂ are consumed stay in the atmosphere. This approach maximizes the likelihood of a model run matching both the modern O₂ and CO constraints on Venus's atmosphere because it both maximizes O₂ loss through this sink as well as maximizing oxidation of CO and CH₄ to CO₂.

The column mass of CO₂ in the atmosphere at the end of the habitable era is varied between 0% and 90% of Venus's present atmospheric CO₂. This accounts for any CO₂ either present in the atmosphere during the habitable era or added at the end of the habitable era through thermal decomposition of habitable era carbonates. We do not consider the 100% case because without volcanism, the sole O₂ sink on Venus is nonthermal escape, which has been quantified in existing studies (21). The remaining CO₂ is volcanically outgassed after the habitable era. The outgassing rate depends on initial conditions, model start time (end of the habitable era) and prescribed c_{CO_2} . We start each run by calculating *ztot*, i.e., the total thickness of a global layer of lava needed to degas sufficient C species for Venus's modern atmosphere to have 90 bar CO₂:

$$z_{tot} = \frac{f_{volc}}{c_{CO_2}\rho_{melt}} M_{CO_2,f}.$$
 [14]

The evolution of Venus's eruption rate is unknown, but the present-day eruption rate has been estimated at $\dot{z}_V = 0.1 - 0.2 \text{ km}^3 \text{ y}^{-1}$ (82), and the total CO₂ concentration-dependent erupted thickness (ztot) is set by the need to outgas enough C-bearing atmospheric species for Venus's modern atmosphere to have 90 bar of CO₂ minus any CO₂ present in the atmosphere at the model start time. Although models of Venus's crustal production based on different possible tectonic regimes exist (42, 83), the exact crustal production history is not known. The crater retention age of Venus's surface is young, suggesting that the planet has been resurfaced geologically recently (51, 52). However, the mechanism for resurfacing is debated. One hypothesis is a catastrophic resurfacing event 0.3 to 1 Gyr ago (53), for example, by episodic subduction with complete renewal of Venus's lithosphere every few hundred million years (42, 84), but an alternative is equilibrium resurfacing by continuous volcanism (54), which is also supported by evidence for ongoing volcanism (85). In our model, we use a highly simplified crustal production history for Venus that assumes continuous volcanism decreasing exponentially over time throughout Venus's history. This is similar to the pattern of melt production for full parameterized convection models of Venus (12). The total erupted volume is set by average melt CO₂ concentration and the proportion of CO₂ in Venus's atmosphere that is sourced from post-habitable era volcanism. We parameterize the eruption rate as an exponential (SI Appendix, Fig. S2):

$$\dot{z}_{erupt} = a \exp\left(-bt\right),$$
[15]

where *t* is time since the end of the habitable period, *b*, is the e-folding timescale of volcanism in Gyr, and *a* is a constant:

$$a = \frac{(\dot{z}_V / f_{ext}) + b \, z_{tot}}{1 - e^{-b \, t_{er}}},$$
[16]

where \dot{z}_V is the present-day crustal production rate, f_{ext} is the extrusive volcanism fraction, and t_{er} is either the end of the habitable era in model time (i.e., $4.5 - t_{start}$) or the model time at which the surface temperature drops below the basalt solidus in runs that begin with an RGH. We assume a modern crustal production rate of 0.1 km³ y⁻¹ (82, 86, 87). We vary f_{ext} from 0.1 to 1 because some of Venus's volcanism must be extrusive to account for the young crater retention age of Venus's surface, and extending to $f_{ext} = 1$ captures both Earth-like extrusive:intrusive volcanism ratios at $f_{ext} = 0.3$ and 0.5 (88) and extreme heat-pipe tectonics at $f_{ext} = 1$ (89). All times are in Gyr. *b* and \dot{z}_V are the most uncertain parameters in this equation as Venus's crustal production history and present extrusive volcanism fraction are poorly constrained.

D. Oxidation of Basalt. O₂ left behind by H escape from the atmosphere may be removed by oxidation of basalt (24):

$$2FeO + 0.5O_2 \rightarrow Fe_2O_3.$$
 [17]

The FeO concentrations at the Venera 13 and 14 landing sites are 9.3 \pm 2.2 wt% and 8.8 \pm 1.8 wt%, respectively (59), with bulk compositions at the Venera 14 and Vega 2 landing sites similar to terrestrial Mid Ocean Ridge Basalts (MORB) (81). The typical FeO concentration in MOR basalts on the Earth is between 7 and 12 wt% (90). We assume that erupted lava on Venus contains an average of 10 wt% FeO, such that 0.1 kg of FeO are emplaced on Venus' surface for each 1 kg of lava. We follow ref. 21 and assume that 1% of lava erupted on Venus is oxidized (*SI Appendix, Oxygen Loss Model*), corresponding to the top 1 cm of a 1-m thick flow. We also assume that lava cannot continue to be oxidized past the timestep when it is produced because it will be buried by subsequent lava flows and diffusion in solid basalt is too slow for buried basalt to remain in contact with atmospheric O₂. The mass of O₂ removed from the atmosphere in a given timestep ($\dot{M}_{O_2,oX}$) is

$$\dot{M}_{02,ox} = M_{02,atm} - 0.01 m_{02} \frac{0.25 \rho c_{\text{FeO}} f_{ex} z_{erupt}(t)}{m_{\text{FeO}}},$$
 [18]

where m_{O2} and m_{FeO} are the molecular masses of O₂ and FeO, respectively, and c_{FeO} is the typical concentration of FeO in basalt in wt%. The factor of 0.25 accounts for the stoichiometry of Eq. **17**. $M_{O2,atm}$ is not allowed to fall below 0.

Volcanism on Venus may not always have been dominated by lava flows. Basaltic eruptions on Earth can be explosive, producing large volumes of ash and scoria (91). We include a procedure for calculating whether or not explosive volcanism is occurring at a given timestep and for calculating the corresponding O_2 sink of the ash and scoria produced (*SI Appendix, Oxygen Loss Model*). When explosive volcanism is active, we assume that all FeO in basaltic material can be oxidized based on the short oxidation timescales of sub-cm fragments in experiments even under modern Venus conditions (92).

- J. O'Callaghan, How three missions to Venus could solve the planet's biggest mysteries. *Nature* 594, 486–487 (2021).
- M. Y. Zolotov, B. Fegley Jr, K. Lodders, Hydrous silicates and water on Venus. *Icarus* 130, 475–494 (1997).
- K. Hamano, Y. Abe, H. Genda, Emergence of two types of terrestrial planet on solidification of magma ocean. Nature 497, 607–610 (2013).
- C. Gillmann, E. Chassefièe, P. Lognonné, A consistent picture of early hydrodynamic escape of Venus atmosphere explaining present Ne and Ar isotopic ratios and low oxygen atmospheric content. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 286, 503–513 (2009).
- M. Turbet et al., Day-night cloud asymmetry prevents early oceans on Venus but not on Earth. Nature 598, 276–280 (2021).
- J. B. Pollack, A nongrey calculation of the runaway greenhouse: Implications for Venus' past and present. *Icarus* 14, 295–306 (1971).
- J. Yang, G. Boué, D. C. Fabrycky, D. S. Abbot, Strong dependence of the inner edge of the habitable zone on planetary rotation rate. Astrophys. J. 787, L2 (2014).
- M. J. Way, A. D. Del Genio, Venusian habitable climate scenarios: Modeling Venus through time and applications to slowly rotating Venus-like exoplanets. J. Geophys. Res.: Planets 125, e2019JE006276 (2020).

E. Radiogenic Ar Degassing Model. Following previous work (27, 28), we model the evolution of Venus's mantle, crust, and atmosphere ⁴⁰K and ⁴⁰Ar inventories forward in time starting from the end of a hypothetical habitable era (*SI Appendix, Radiogenic Ar Degassing Model for details*). Our models begin with mantle ⁴⁰K concentrations set by the decay of ⁴⁰K from Venus formation to the end of the habitable era and with some fraction of the resulting radiogenic ⁴⁰Ar (f_{pre} ranging from 0 to 1) in the atmosphere.

⁴⁰Ar degassing occurs as a result of crustal production. New crust is produced by melting of the mantle at the crustal production rate set by the parameters t_{end} , f_{volc} , f_{ext} , and c_{CO_2} in our Oxygen Loss Model. We also consider an additional four parameters: crustal thickness, average melt fraction, and Venus's primordial mantle U concentration and K/U ratio (*SI Appendix*, Table S2) (27, 28). During partial melting, ⁴⁰K and ⁴⁰Ar preferentially partition into the melt, enriching the melt in these species. We assume that ⁴⁰Ar partitioned into the melt is released instantaneously into the atmosphere (28) and the ⁴⁰K enters the crust. The ⁴⁰K in the newly erupted crust decays over time to produce more ⁴⁰Ar that we assume diffuses rapidly to the atmosphere (28). To calculate this ⁴⁰Ar release at each timestep, we find the ⁴⁰K decay integrated across the entire depth of the crust, which we assume has a fixed thickness. We track the ⁴⁰K concentration throughout the crust at depth intervals of 1 m and consider cases both with and without recycling of ⁴⁰K back into the mantle(*SIAppendix*, Fig. S5).

Example ⁴⁰Ar degassing runs for a range of crustal production histories are shown in *SI Appendix*, Fig. S3. Model runs with final atmospheric ⁴⁰Ar inventories that match Venus's modern atmospheric composition are marked as successful. We then find the proportion of successful Ar degassing runs overall and for each unique combination of t_{end} , f_{volc} , f_{ext} , and c_{CO_2} . We multiply these by our oxygen loss model success rates to find the overall proportion of runs that can successfully match Venus's modern atmospheric composition (Fig. 5).

F. Water Recycling During the Habitable Era. To determine the conditions under which hydrated crust can be recycled into the mantle during a hypothetical habitable era, we calculate 1-D steady state geotherms for lithosphere of a fixed thickness z_{lith} and with a fixed downward advection velocity v equal to the crustal production rate. We assume a heat pipe-style regime where new crust is produced through extrusive volcanism, leading to burial of older crust, and the eventual recycling of material from the base of the lithosphere into the underlying convecting mantle (42). The resulting geotherm (38, 39) is compared to phase boundaries for eclogite formation (40) and serpentinite dehydration (41). If eclogite formation is enabled first, then hydrated crust is recycled into the mantle (*SI Appendix, Habitable Era Water Recycling Model* for details).

Data, Materials, and Software Availability. All of the code for this paper, including instructions to reproduce all figures, can be found on GitHub at https://github.com/aowarren/Venus_02. Data from completed model runs can be obtained viaZenodo at https://zenodo.org/record/7416204#.Y5UVEXbMK3A.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS. This project made use of University of Chicago Research Computing Center resources. Grants: NASA NNH19ZDA001N-FINESST (F.I.A.O. Warren).

- M. J. Way et al., Was Venus the first habitable world of our solar system? Geophys. Res. Lett. 43, 8376–8383 (2016).
- J. F. Kasting, Runaway and moist greenhouse atmospheres and the evolution of Earth and Venus. Icarus 74, 472–494 (1988).
- A. Salvador et al., The relative influence of H₂O and CO₂ on the primitive surface conditions and evolution of rocky planets. J. Geophys. Res.: Planets 122, 1458–1486 (2017).
- J. Krissansen-Totton, J. J. Fortney, F. Nimmo, Was Venus ever habitable? Constraints from a coupled interior-atmosphere-redox evolution model. *Planet. Sci. J.* 2, 216 (2021).
- C. De Bergh *et al.*, Deuterium on Venus: Observations from earth. *Science* 251, 547–549 (1991).
- T. M. Donahue, J. H. Hoffman, R. R. Hodges, A. J. Watson, Venus was wet: A measurement of the ratio of deuterium to hydrogen. *Science* 216, 630–633 (1982).
- Y. Kulikov et al., Atmospheric and water loss from early Venus. Planet. Space Sci. 54, 1425–1444 (2006).
- T. M. Donahue, New analysis of hydrogen and deuterium escape from Venus. *Icarus* 141, 226–235 (1999).
- D. H. Grinspoon, Implications of the high D/H ratio for the sources of water in Venus' atmosphere. *Nature* 363, 428–431 (1993).

- F. Selsis et al., Habitable planets around the star Gliese 581? Astron. Astrophys. 476, 1373–1387 (2007).
- J. Horner, O. Mousis, J. M. Petit, B. Jones, Differences between the impact regimes of the terrestrial planets: Implications for primordial d:H ratios. *Planet. Space Sci.* 57, 1338–1345 (2009).
- K. Pahlevan, L. Schaefer, M. M. Hirschmann, Hydrogen isotopic evidence for early oxidation of silicate earth. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **526**, 115770 (2019).
- 21. C. Gillmann et al., Dry late accretion inferred from Venus's coupled atmosphere and internal evolution. Nat. Geosci. 13, 265-269 (2020).
- A. P. Ingersoll, The runaway greenhouse: A history of water on Venus. J. Atmos. Sci. 26, 1191–1198 (1969).
- F. Tian, History of water loss and atmospheric O₂ buildup on rocky exoplanets near M dwarfs. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 432, 126–132 (2015).
- A. W. Heard, E. S. Kite, A probabilistic case for a large missing carbon sink on Mars after 3.5 billion years ago. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 531, 116001 (2020).
- 25. V. Moroz, The atmosphere of Venus. Space Sci. Rev. 29, 3–127 (1981).
- N. M. Johnson, M. R. R. de Oliveira, Venus atmospheric composition in situ data: A compilation. Earth Space Sci. 6, 1299–1318 (2019).
- J. G. O'Rourke, J. Korenaga, Thermal evolution of Venus with argon degassing. *Icarus* 260, 128–140 (2015).
- W. M. Kaula, Constraints on Venus evolution from radiogenic argon. *Icarus* 139, 32-39 (1999).
 E. Chassefière, Hydrodynamic escape of oxygen from primitive atmospheres: Applications to the
- cases of Venus and Mars. *Icarus* 124, 537-552 (1996).
 C. Gillmann, E. Chassefière, P. Lognonné, A consistent picture of early hydrodynamic escape of Venus atmosphere explaining present Ne and Ar isotopic ratios and low oxygen atmospheric content. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 286, 503-513 (2009).
- 31. J. Deng, Z. Du, B. B. Karki, D. B. Ghosh, K. K. Lee, A magma ocean origin to divergent redox
- evolutions of rocky planetary bodies and early atmospheres. *Nat. Commun.* **11**, 1–7 (2020). 32. E. Cottrell, K. A. Kelley, The oxidation state of Fe in MORB glasses and the oxygen fugacity of the
- upper mantle. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **305**, 270–282 (2011). 33. K. Zahnle *et al.*, Emergence of a habitable planet. *Space Sci. Rev.* **129**, 35–78 (2007).
- M. Turbet, D. Ehrenreich, C. Lovis, E. Bolmont, T. Fauchez, The runaway greenhouse radius inflation effect - An observational diagnostic to probe water on Earth-sized planets and test the habitable zone concept. Astron. Astrophys. 628, A12 (2019).
- I. Ribas, E. F. Guinan, M. Gudel, M. Audard, Evolution of the solar activity over time and effects on planetary atmospheres I. High-energy irradiances (1–1700 Å). Astrophys. J. 622, 680–694 (2005).
- B. J. Foley, A. J. Smye, Carbon ycling and habitability of Earth-sized stagnant lid planets. Astrobiology 18, 873–896 (2018).
- A. Morschhauser, M. Grott, D. Breuer, Crustal recycling, mantle dehydration, and the thermal evolution of Mars. *Icarus* 212, 541–558 (2011).
- T. C. O'Reilly, G. F. Davies, Magma transport of heat on Io: A mechanism allowing a thick lithosphere. *Geophys. Res. Lett.* 8, 313–316 (1981).
- D. G. Kankanamge, W. B. Moore, A parameterization for volcanic heat flux in heat pipe planets. J. Geophys. Res.: Planets 124, 114-127 (2019).
- K. Bucher, M. Frey, "Metamorphism of mafic rocks" in Petrogenesis of Metamorphic Rocks (Springer, 2002), pp. 279–324.
- B. R. Hacker, G. A. Abers, S. M. Peacock, Subduction factory 1. Theoretical mineralogy, densities, seismic wave speeds, and H₂O contents. J. Geophys. Res.: Solid Earth 108 (2003).
- M. Armann, P. J. Tackley, Simulating the thermochemical magmatic and tectonic evolution of Venus's mantle and lithosphere: Two-dimensional models. J. Geophys. Res.: Planets 117 (2012).
- D. Hasterok, J. Webb, On the radiogenic heat production of igneous rocks. *Geosci. Front.* 8, 919–940 (2017).
- P. B. James, M. T. Zuber, R. J. Phillips, Crustal thickness and support of topography on Venus. J. Geophys. Res.: Planets 118, 859–875 (2013).
- L. Schaefer, D. Sasselov, The persistence of oceans on Earth-like planets: Insights from the deepwater cycle. Astrophys. J. 801, 40 (2015).
- S. E. Smrekar, A. Davaille, C. Sotin, Venus interior structure and dynamics. Space Sci. Rev. 214, 1–34 (2018).
- N. Wogan, J. Krissansen-Totton, D. C. Catling, Abundant atmospheric methane from volcanism on terrestrial planets is unlikely and strengthens the case for methane as a biosignature. *Planet. Sci. J.* 1, 58 (2020).
- M. A. Bullock, D. H. Grinspoon, The recent evolution of climate on Venus. *Icarus* 150, 19–37 (2001).
- D. V. Titov et al., Radiation in the Atmosphere of Venus (American Geophysical Union, 2007), pp. 121–138.
- D. V. Titov, G. Piccioni, P. Drossart, W. J. Markiewicz, Radiative Energy Balance in the Venus Atmosphere, L. Bengtsson et al., Eds. (Springer, New York, 2013), pp. 23–53.
- R. J. Phillips et al., Impact craters and Venus resurfacing history. J. Geophys. Res.: Planets 97, 15923–15948 (1992).
- W. F. Bottke et al., "On asteroid impacts, crater scaling laws, and a proposed younger surface age for Venus" in Lunar and Planetary Science Conference, Lunar and Planetary Science Conference (2016), p. 2036.
- R. G. Strom, G. G. Schaber, D. D. Dawson, The global resurfacing of Venus. J. Geophys. Res.: Planets 99, 10899–10926 (1994).
- E. Bjonnes, V. L. Hansen, B. James, J. B. Swenson, Equilibrium resurfacing of Venus: Results from new Monte Carlo modeling and implications for Venus surface histories. *Icarus* 217, 451–461 (2012).
- J. G. O'Rourke, Venus: A thick basal magma ocean may exist today. *Geophys. Res. Lett.* 47, e2019GL086126 (2020).
- I. H. Campbell, S. R. Taylor, No water, no granites No oceans, no continents. *Geophys. Res. Lett.* 10, 1061–1064 (1983).

- J. G. Shellnutt, Petrological modeling of basaltic rocks from Venus: A case for the presence of silicic rocks. J. Geophys. Res.: Planets 118, 1350–1364 (2013).
- M. D. Dyar, J. Helbert, A. Maturilli, N. T. Müller, D. Kappel, Probing Venus surface iron contents with six-band visible near-infrared spectroscopy from orbit. *Geophys. Res. Lett.* 47, e2020GL090497 (2020).
- Yu. A. Surkov, V. L. Barsukov, L. P. Moskalyeva, V. P. Kharyukova, A. L. Kemurdzhian, New data on the composition, structure, and properties of Venus rock obtained by Venera 13 and Venera 14. J. Geophys. Res.: Solid Earth 89, B393–B402 (1984).
- D. Höning, P. Baumeister, J. L. Grenfell, N. Tosi, M. J. Way, Early habitability and crustal decarbonation of a stagnant-lid venus. J. Geophys. Res.: Planets 126, e2021JE006895 (2021).
- D. Kerrick, J. Connolly, Metamorphic devolatilization of subducted marine sediments and the transport of volatiles into the Earth's mantle. *Nature* 411, 293–296 (2001).
- R. D. Wordsworth, R. T. Pierrehumbert, Water loss from terrestrial planets with CO₂-rich atmospheres. Astrophys. J. 778, 154 (2013).
- M. Turbet et al., Revised mass-radius relationships for water-rich rocky planets more irradiated than the runaway greenhouse limit. Astron. Astrophys. 638, A41 (2020).
- C. Lécuyer, L. Simon, F. Guyot, Comparison of carbon, nitrogen and water budgets on Venus and the Earth. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 181, 33–40 (2000).
- L. Schaefer, R. D. Wordsworth, Z. Berta-Thompson, D. Sasselov, Predictions of the atmospheric composition of GJ 1132b. Astrophys. J. 829, 63 (2016).
- P. M. Smith, P. D. Asimow, Adiabat_1ph: A new public front-end to the MELTS, pMELTS, and pHMELTS models. *Geochem. Geophys. Geosyst.* 6 (2005).
- P. D. Asimow, M. S. Ghiorso, Algorithmic modifications extending MELTS to calculate subsolidus phase relations. Am. Mineral. 83, 1127–1132 (1998).
- M. S. Ghiorso, R. O. Sack, Chemical mass transfer in magmatic processes IV. A revised and internally consistent thermodynamic model for the interpolation and extrapolation of liquid-solid equilibria in magmatic systems at elevated temperatures and pressures. *Contrib. Mineral. Petrol.* **119**, 197–212 (1995).
- F. Tian, Atmospheric escape from solar system terrestrial planets and exoplanets. Ann. Rev. Earth Planet. Sci. 43, 459-476 (2015).
- K. J. Zahnle, J. F. Kasting, Mass fractionation during transonic escape and implications for loss of water from Mars and Venus. *Icarus* 68, 462–480 (1986).
- T. R. Marrero, E. A. Mason, Gaseous diffusion coefficients. J. Phys. Chem. Ref. Data 1, 3–118 (1972).
- M. Pätzold *et al.*, The structure of Venus' middle atmosphere and ionosphere. *Nature* 450, 657-660 (2007).
- K. J. Zahnle, D. C. Catling, The cosmic shoreline: The evidence that escape determines which planets have atmospheres, and what this may mean for proxima centauri B. Astrophys. J. 843, 122 (2017).
- H. Lammer et al., Loss of hydrogen and oxygen from the upper atmosphere of Venus. Planet. Space Sci. 54, 1445–1456 (2006).
- C. P. Johnstone, M. Güdel, H. Lammer, K. G. Kislyakova, Upper atmospheres of terrestrial planets: Carbon dioxide cooling and the Earth's thermospheric evolution. *Astron. Astrophys.* 617, A107 (2018).
- C. Gillmann, G. J. Golabek, P. J. Tackley, Effect of a single large impact on the coupled atmosphereinterior evolution of Venus. *Icarus* 268, 295–312 (2016).
- A. E. Saal, E. H. Hauri, C. H. Langmuir, M. R. Perfit, Vapour undersaturation in primitive mid-oceanridge basalt and the volatile content of Earth's upper mantle. *Nature* 419, 451–455 (2002).
- L. V. Danyushevsky, The effect of small amounts of H₂O on crystallisation of mid-ocean ridge and backarc basin magmas. J. Volcanol. Geotherm. Res. **110**, 265–280 (2001).
- S. Soule et al., CO₂ variability in mid-ocean ridge basalts from syn-emplacement degassing: Constraints on eruption dynamics. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. **327**, 39-49 (2012).
- C. Helo, M. A. Longpré, N. Shimizu, D. A. Clague, J. Stix, Explosive eruptions at mid-ocean ridges driven by CO₂-rich magmas. *Nat. Geosci.* 4, 260–263 (2011).
- J. Kargel, G. Komatsu, V. Baker, R. Strom, The volcanology of Venera and VEGA landing sites and the geochemistry of Venus. *Icarus* 103, 253–275 (1993).
- A. Basilevsky, J. Head, G. Schaber, R. Strom, "The resurfacing history of Venus " in *Venus II*, R. P. S. W. Bougher, D. M. Hunten, Eds. (University of Arizona Press, Tuscon, 1997).
- M. B. Weller, W. S. Kiefer, The physics of changing tectonic regimes: Implications for the temporal evolution of mantle convection and the thermal history of Venus. J. Geophys. Res.: Planets 125, e2019JE005960 (2020).
- D. L. Turcotte, An episodic hypothesis for Venusian tectonics. J. Geophys. Res.: Planets 98, 17061–17068 (1993).
- S. E. Smrekar *et al.*, Recent hotspot volcanism on Venus from VIRTIS emissivity data. *Science* 328, 605–608 (2010).
- R. G. Strom, G. G. Schaber, D. D. Dawson, The global resurfacing of Venus. J. Geophys. Res.: Planets 99, 10899–10926 (1994).
- M. A. Ivanov, J. W. Head, The history of volcanism on Venus. *Planet. Space Sci.* 84, 66-92 (2013).
- S. M. White, J. A. Crisp, F. J. Spera, Long-term volumetric eruption rates and magma budgets. Geochem. Geophys. Geosyst. 7 (2006).
- W. B. Moore, J. I. Simon, A. A. G. Webb, Heat-pipe planets. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 474, 13-19 (2017).
- C. H. Langmuir, E. M. Klein, T. Plank, Petrological Systematics of Mid-Ocean Ridge Basalts: Constraints on Melt Generation Beneath Ocean Ridges in Mantle Flow and Melt Generation at Mid-Ocean Ridges (American Geophysical Union, 2013), pp. 183–280.
- B. Houghton, H. Gonnermann, Basaltic explosive volcanism: Constraints from deposits and models. Geochemistry 68, 117-140 (2008).
- G. Berger et al., Experimental exploration of volcanic rocks-atmosphere interaction under Venus surface conditions. *Icarus* 329, 8–23 (2019).



² Supplementary Information for

³ Narrow range of early habitable Venus scenarios permitted by modelling of oxygen loss and

⁴ radiogenic argon degassing

5 Alexandra O. Warren and Edwin S. Kite

6 Corresponding Author name.

7 E-mail: aowarren@uchicago.edu

8 This PDF file includes:

- ⁹ Supplementary text
- ¹⁰ Figs. S1 to S10
- 11 Tables S1 to S2
- 12 SI References

1

13 Supporting Information Text

14 Oxygen loss model

¹⁵ **Crustal production upper limit.** For an Earth-like internal heating rate and a 500 K temperature drop between the melting ¹⁶ region and the surface the maximum crustal production rate is $\sim 175 \text{ km}^3 \text{ yr}^{-1}(1)$. Volcanism at this rate over 4 Gyr would ¹⁷ produce $\sim 1500 \text{ km}$ of crust (not accounting for changing heating rate over time or mantle cooling), implying substantial crustal ¹⁸ recycling, and eruption of 80% of Venus' mantle. For a melt fraction of 15%, at the upper end of terrestrial Mid Ocean Ridge ¹⁹ melting, this crustal production rate would imply melt processing of Venus' mantle volume 5 times. Crustal recycling may aid ²⁰ Venus in retaining its water (2). Parameterized stagnant lid convection models constrained by ⁴⁰Ar measurements suggest ²¹ total crustal production of a global layer <65 km, and melt processing of up to 1.2 Venus mantle volumes (3). However, 2D

simulations (1) of Venus' thermal evolution including episodic lid convection are able to produce up to 1.2 mantle volumes of crust over Venus' lifetime (implying crustal recycling)

²³ crust over Venus' lifetime (implying crustal recycling).

Oxidation of lava flows. Experimental work on oxidising basaltic lava flows (4–6) suggests that exposed olivine, pyroxene, and 24 basaltic glasses should oxidise under present-day Venus conditions within weeks to months, and pyroxene on timescales of 25 weeks to decades, or even faster. However, these timescales apply only to materials exposed directly to the atmosphere. The 26 formation of a surface coating of oxidized minerals may prevent thick oxidation rinds from forming in Venus basalts (4). To 27 model oxidation of Venusian lava flows, we assume that basaltic lava flows on Venus have a typical thickness of $\sim 1 \text{ m}$ (7), 28 resembling terrestrial lavas. The depth of oxidation is controlled by the diffusivity of cations and oxygen in basalt (8). These 29 diffusivities are much higher in melts than in solid basalt (8-10). Eruption rates on present day Venus are estimated to be of 30 order $0.1 - 0.2 \text{ km}^3 \text{ yr}^{-1}$. Taking an average lava flow thickness of 1 m, this corresponds to 1 m of lava being erupted every 31 ~ 4 Myr. Even under present-day Venus surface temperatures, lavas are expected to chill crusts 4 m thick in 2 months (7). 32 Using the approximation: 33

 $\Delta z \approx \sqrt{D\Delta t} \tag{1}$

thermal diffusivity in the lava flow is 10^{-2} cm² s⁻¹, 4 orders of magnitude greater than the diffusivity of oxygen in basaltic melts ($D \approx 10^{-6}$ cm² s⁻¹) (9, 10), suggesting that oxidation of lava before solidification is limited to <1 mm. However, slower oxidation of solidified lava flows may still proceed, slowing down as the lava flow cools. For a lava flow exposed to the surface at 700 K for 40,000 years (1 timestep), the diffusive length scale is ~ 0.1 cm. Also taking into account a) faster diffusion while the lava flow is still hot, and b) surface undulations and cooling cracks that increase the surface area in contact with the atmosphere.

Runaway Greenhouse Surface Temperature. We find surface temperature at each timestep, given the incoming solar flux relative to Earth's insolation (S_{eff}) and partial pressure of H₂O in the atmosphere in bars (p_{H_2O}) , using a curve fit to existing numerical results (11):

$$log_{10} \left(T_{surf}(x, y, z) \right) = c_1 + c_2 x + c_3 y + c_4 z + c_5 x^2 + c_6 x y + c_8 z^2 + c_9 y^3 + c_{10} z^3$$

44 where:

34

$$x = (log_{10} (P_{H_2O}) - k_1) / k_2$$
$$y = (log_{10} (g) - k_3) / k_4$$

 $z = (log_{10} (S_{eff}) - k_5) / k_6$

45 Coefficient values for c_{1-10} and k_{1-6} are given in Table S1.

⁴⁶ Drag of heavy species during H escape. If H escape to space is sufficiently rapid, the H can drag heavier species (such as O)

⁴⁷ along with it (12). To determine whether this process is active at a given timestep in our model, we calculate the critical mass ⁴⁸ (m_c) of the heaviest molecule escaping H can drag along with it in a background atmosphere of mass m_{atm} (12):

 $_{48}$ (m_c) of the heaviest molecule escaping if can drag along with it in a background atmosphere of mass m_{atm}

$$m_{c} = \frac{X_{H} + q^{2} X_{atm}}{X_{H} + q X_{atm}} m_{H} + \frac{k T M_{H,ref}}{m_{H} bg \left(X_{H} + q X_{atm}\right)}$$
[2]

where $q = m_{atm}/m_H$. In our model runs, we only see $m_c \ge m_O$ at the very beginning of models with > 700 m GEL H₂O with hypothetical habitable eras ending at 4 Ga and $f_{volc} \ge 0.9$, i.e. H escape is not limited by diffusion through the background CO₂ atmosphere. Under these conditions there is more than an order of magnitude more O in the background atmosphere than CO₂, and we approximate the atmosphere as a mixture of H and O only to find the resulting H and O escape rates (12):

$$\dot{M}_{O,esc} = \frac{\eta q}{1 + \eta q} \dot{M}_{H,ref}$$

[3]

49

55

$$\dot{M}_{H,esc} = \frac{1}{1 + \eta q} \dot{M}_{H,ref}$$
[4]

57 where:

56

58

5

$$\eta = \frac{Y - 1}{Y X_H / X_O + q} \tag{5}$$

$$Y = \frac{kT\dot{M}_{H,ref}}{(q-1)bgX_H m_H^2}$$
[6]

Explosive Volcanism. Although high atmospheric pressure disfavors explosive volcanism on Venus today, dissolved magmatic 60 volatiles drive explosive volcanism at pressures greater than Venus' atmospheric pressure in subaqueous envrionments, such 61 as MORs (13, 14). Several authors report observations of evidence for explosive volcanism on Venus, invoking volatile 62 concentrations of order 1-3 wt% CO₂, SO₂ and H₂O (15, 16). However, CO₂ as the primary magmatic volatile phase is 63 64 unlikely to drive explosive volcanism on present day Venus because concentrations above 6.5 wt% would be required (17). 65 The conditions required for explosive volcanism are sensitive not only to atmospheric pressure but also to melt ascent rates, magma temperatures, melt viscosity, and vent geometry (17, 18). We choose to implement the simplest possible threshold for 66 the effusive-explosive transition, allowing explosive volcanism to occur when the volume fraction of gas (F_{gas}) exceeds ~75% 67 (19, 20). We find the volume of gas per m³ melt delivered to the surface (V_{gas}) using the ideal gas law: 68

$$V_{gas} = \frac{n_{degas} R T_{melt}}{P_{atm}}$$
[7]

where n_{degas} is the number of moles of degassed CO₂ and H₂O. The corresponding volume fraction of gas is:

$$F_{gas} = \frac{V_{gas}}{V_{gas} + 1} \tag{8}$$

For $F_{gas} \ge 0.75$, the mass of O₂ removed from the atmosphere in a given timestep $(\dot{M}_{O_2,ox})$ is:

$$\dot{M}_{O2,ox} = M_{O2,atm} - m_{O2} \frac{0.25\rho c_{\rm FeO} f_{ex} z_{erupt}(t)}{m_{\rm FeO}}$$
[9]

74 Radiogenic Ar Degassing Model

The initial concentration of 40 K in Venus' mantle is given by (3, 21):

76

80

83

85

87

71

73

$$[^{40}K(0)] = r_{(^{40}K/K)}r_{(K/U)}c_{(U,M)}\exp(\lambda_{tot}t)$$
^[10]

⁷⁷ where $r_{(K/U)}$ is the ratio of K to U for Venus' crust as measured by spacecraft (21), $r_{(^{40}K/K)} = 1.165 \times 10^{-4}$ is the present ⁷⁸ ${}^{40}K/K$ ratio (21), $c_{(U,M)}$ is the primordial mantle U concentration based on values calculated for the Earth (SI Appendix: ⁷⁹ Table S2) (3), where t is present time after Venus' formation (4.5 Gyr), and λ_{tot} is the decay constant for ${}^{40}K$:

$$\lambda_{tot} = \lambda_{\rm Ar} + \lambda_{\rm Ca} \tag{11}$$

⁸¹ Where $\lambda_{Ar} = 0.0581 \text{ Gyr}^{-1}$ and $\lambda_{Ca} = 0.4962 \text{ Gyr}^{-1}$ are the decay constants for decay of ⁴⁰K to ⁴⁰Ar and ⁴⁰Ca respectively ⁸² (21). Our models begin at the end of a hypothetical habitable era. We calculate the starting mantle ⁴⁰K concentration:

$$\left[{}^{40}\mathbf{K}(t_0)\right] = \left[{}^{40}\mathbf{K}(0)\right] \exp\left(-\lambda_{tot}(4.5 - t_0)\right)$$
[12]

starting mantle ⁴⁰Ar concentration:

$$\left[{}^{40}\operatorname{Ar}_{M}(t_{0})\right] = (1 - f_{pre}) \left[{}^{40}\operatorname{K}(0)\right] (1 - \exp\left(-\lambda_{tot}(4.5 - t_{0})\right))$$
[13]

and starting atmospheric 40 Ar abundance:

$${}^{40}\operatorname{Ar}(t_0)_a = f_{pre} V_M \rho_M \left[{}^{40}\operatorname{K}(0) \right] \left(1 - \exp\left(-\lambda_{tot} (4.5 - t_0) \right) \right)$$
[14]

where f_{pre} is the fraction of radiogenic ⁴⁰Ar degassed prior to the end of the habitable era, $\rho_M = 3550$ kg m⁻³ is the density of the mantle (22), and V_M is the mantle volume, taking Venus' core radius to be 3110 km (23). Next, we evolve the mantle and atmosphere ⁴⁰K and ⁴⁰Ar inventories forwards in time (SI Appendix: Fig S4) until the present

Next, we evolve the mantle and atmosphere 40 K and 40 Ar inventories forwards in time (SI Appendix: Fig S4) until the present day based on the parameters in each of our O₂ loss models, calculating the crustal production rate using Equations ??-??. We assume that crustal thickness does not evolve over time, and instead consider a range of fixed thicknesses.

The concentration of ⁴⁰K in Venus' mantle at each new timestep $\left(\begin{bmatrix} 40 \\ M \end{bmatrix}_{M i+1}\right)$ is given by:

Alexandra O. Warren and Edwin S. Kite

94

108

112

115

118

120

126

129

131

where $\rho_c = 2800 \text{ kg m}^{-3}$ is the density of the crust, and D_c is the crustal thickness. $V_{new,i} = z_{new}A_{Venus}$ is the volume of new crust produced in one timestep.

 V_{rec} is the volume of crust recycled back into the mantle at a given timestep, which is given by the difference between the total crustal thickness at timestep *i* and the fixed maximum crustal thickness, D_c . We track the concentration of ⁴⁰K throughout the crust with depth in 1 m intervals to calculate the amount of ⁴⁰K recycled back into Venus' mantle over time. We also consider a case in which recycled crust is not remixed into the mantle, and instead sinks into a separate mantle reservoir, in which case we set the final term of Equation 15 to 0. This depletes the melting mantle of ⁴⁰K over time, and permits a wider range of crustal production histories for Venus that can still fall within or below the measured range for Venus' atmospheric ⁴⁰Ar abundance.

¹⁰⁴ New crust is produced by partial melting of the mantle. This sets the initial ⁴⁰K concentration of the crust. We consider ¹⁰⁵ melt fractions of $\Phi = 0.025$ and 0.05 (SI Appendix: Table S2) (3). During partial melting, ⁴⁰K and ⁴⁰Ar preferentially partition ¹⁰⁶ into the melt, enriching the melt in these species. The concentration of ⁴⁰K in new crust (which is also the concentration of ¹⁰⁷ ⁴⁰K in mantle melts) formed through fractional melting of the mantle is:

$$[\mathbf{K}]_{c,i} = [\mathbf{K}]_{m,i} = [\mathbf{K}]_{M,i} \frac{1}{\phi} \left[1 - (1 - \phi)^{1/D_{\mathbf{K}}} \right]$$
[16]

where $D_{\rm K}$ is the partition coefficient of K in the melt, which is very small (24), so we make the approximation $(1-\phi)^{1/D} \approx 0$ (3, 21). In our model, we assume that ⁴⁰Ar in the melt is released instantaneously to the atmosphere (3). The mass of ⁴⁰Ar released to the atmosphere at each timestep by partial melting and crustal production is:

$${}^{40}\operatorname{Ar}_{M\to a,i} = V_{new,i}\rho_c \left[\operatorname{Ar}\right]_M \frac{1}{\phi} \left[1 - (1 - \phi)^{1/D_{\operatorname{Ar}}}\right]$$
[17]

where D_{Ar} is the partition coefficient of Ar in the melt, approximated in the same way as for ⁴⁰K (3, 21). The concentration of ⁴⁰K in the crust at each timestep is given by:

$$\begin{bmatrix} {}^{40}\mathbf{K}(z) \end{bmatrix}_{c,i} = \begin{bmatrix} {}^{40}\mathbf{K} \end{bmatrix}_{c,i} - \begin{bmatrix} {}^{40}\mathbf{K} \end{bmatrix}_{c,i} \exp(-\Delta t\lambda_{\mathbf{K}})$$
[18]

The corresponding release of 40 Ar to the atmosphere by 40 K decay in the crust and rapid diffusion of 40 Ar to the surface (3) is given by:

$${}^{40}\operatorname{Ar}_{c \to a,i} = \rho_c A_{Venus} \frac{\lambda_{Ar}}{\lambda_K} \exp(-\Delta t \lambda_K) \int_{D_c}^0 \left[{}^{40}\operatorname{K}(z) \right]_{c,i+1} dz$$
^[19]

Therefore, the total 40 Ar in the atmosphere at each timestep is:

 ${}^{40}\operatorname{Ar}_{a,i+1} = {}^{40}\operatorname{Ar}_{a,i} + {}^{40}\operatorname{Ar}_{c \to a} + {}^{40}\operatorname{Ar}_{M \to a,i}$ [20]

121 Habitable Era Water Recycling Model

We assume Venus produced enough crust to degas 80 bar of CO_2 prior to the end of the habitable era to maximize the potential for extensive recycling of hydrated crust into the mantle by increasing the rate of crustal burial. Heat transport in a stagnant lid regime with downwards advection of crust caused by continuous resurfacing by lava flows with diffusion of heat and internal radiogenic heat production, can be expressed as (25, 26):

$$\alpha \frac{\partial^2 T}{\partial z^2} = v \frac{\partial T}{\partial z} + \frac{H}{\rho c_p}$$
[21]

where $\alpha = \frac{k}{\rho c_p}$ is the diffusion coefficient, k is conductivity, ρ is density, and c_p is specific heat capacity, and H is internal heat production by decay of radioactive elements. The steady state solution is (26):

$$T(z) = \frac{z_{lith}}{v} \frac{H}{\rho c_p} + c_1 \frac{\alpha}{v} \exp \frac{v z_{lith}}{\alpha} + c_2$$
[22]

130 where c_1 and c_2 are constants:

$$c_1 = \frac{v}{\alpha} \frac{\left(\Delta T - \frac{\rho c_p H z_{lith}}{v}\right)}{\exp\left(\frac{v z_{lith}}{\alpha}\right) - 1}$$
[23]

. .

4 of 18

137

$$c_2 = T_s - c_1 \frac{\alpha}{v} \tag{24}$$

133 where $\Delta T = T(z_{lith}) - T(0)$.

The advection velocity v depends on the timing of the end of the habitable era (t_0 from our O₂ loss model), the proportion of Venus' modern CO₂ degassed prior to the end of the habitable era ($1 - f_{volc}$), and melt CO₂ concentration. We assume that the eruption rate (and therefore v) is constant over the period 4.4 Ga to t_0 , such that:

$$v = \frac{1}{3.15 \times 10^{16} (4.4 - t_0)} \frac{(1 - f_{volc})}{c_{\rm CO_2} \rho_{melt}} M_{CO_2, f}$$
[25]

where the factor of 3.15×10^{16} converts from Gyrs to seconds.

¹³⁹ We compare our calculated geotherms to the phase boundaries for serpentinite dehydration and eclogite formation (27, 28) ¹⁴⁰ (SI Appendix, Fig S5) to find combinations of lithosphere thickness and volumentric heat production rate that permit eclogite ¹⁴¹ to form before serpentinite dehydration occurs. When the temperature-pressure profile crosses into the serpentinite dehydration ¹⁴² field first, we assume that water returns to the surface or shallower depths in the crust, as suggested by the upward migration ¹⁴³ of water released by serpentinization during subduction on Earth. Additionally, we omit all geotherms where temperatures ¹⁴⁴ exceed 1573 K at depths shallower than z_{lith} , as the base of the lithosphere is defined by this temperature in our model. We ¹⁴⁵ find that eclogite forms before dehydration occurs when v and z_{lith} are large, and H is small (SI Appendix, Fig S5).

Eclogite formation before dehydration provides a mechanism for recycling of H_2O into the mantle. We consider the implications of removal of water to the mantle on the evolution of the total surface water inventory of a hypothetical habitable era.

We initiate our models with an initial surface water inventory h_0 of up to 4000 m GEL, at the beginning of a hypothetical 149 habitable era. At each timestep, we calculate the water removed from the surface inventory, and the water added by volcanic 150 degassing. We assume that any hydrated crust is removed due to burial by new lava being erupted at the surface, so the 151 crust moves downward at the advection velocity v (Equation 25). We use the same volcanic degassing procedure as for our 152 initial O₂ loss models (Main Text Methods: C. Degassing), and the same range of melt H₂O concentrations (Main Text Table 153 1). However, we fix atmospheric pressure to <10 bar, based on climate models (29), rather than tracking accumulation of 154 atmospheric CO₂ as climate models for early Venus indicate that low atmospheric pressures are required to sustain surface 155 liquid water (30). The total GEL of water present at each timestep i is then: 156

$$h_{i} = h_{i-1} - \frac{1}{\rho_{w}} \Delta t f_{hyd} A_{h} f_{ext} v \rho_{c} + \frac{1}{\rho_{w}} \Delta t f_{ext} v \rho_{c} (c_{\rm H_{2O}} - s_{\rm H_{2O}})$$

$$[26]$$

157

where $\rho_w = 1000 \text{ kg m}^{-3}$ is the density of water, $\rho_c = 2800 \text{ kg m}^{-3}$ is the density of the crust, f_{hyd} is the mass fraction of water in hydrated crust (up to 3 wt% (31)), A_h is the fraction of Venus' surface area submerged by the existing surface water inventory, and s_{H_2O} is the solubility of water in the crust-producing melt as calculated using VolcGasses. To obtain A_h , we use modern Venus hypsometry (32) to calculate the global equivalent layer of water that can be stored beneath any given elevation on Venus, and the cumulative area of Venus' surface beneath each elevation. We then interpolate to find the cumulative area of Venus' surface submerged at each timestep in our model.



Fig. S1. Timing of the end of a hypothetical habitable era is an important parameter for determining whether the habitable era can be reconciled with modern Venus' low atmospheric O₂. Time evolution of column masses of H₂O, H₂, O₂, CO₂, CO₂, CO₂, and CH₄ for two post habitable era evolutions, each with a 300 m GEL water inventory, average melt H₂O 0.001 wt%, average melt CO₂ 500 ppm, extrusive volcanism fraction $f_{ext} = 1.0$, fraction of Venus' modern CO₂ volcanically degassed since the end of a hypothetical habitable era $f_{volc} = 1.0$, and melt oxygen fugacity $\log fO_2 = FMQ-1$ in our baseline model (no runaway greenhouse surface melting). The solid line shows that a short-lived habitable era ending at 4.0 Ga can be reconciled with Venus' modern atmospheric O₂ (solid lines), whereas a habitable era ending at 3.0 Ga cannot (dashed line).



Fig. S2. Magmatism rates (including both intrusive and extrusive volcanism) as a function of time in our model for end habitable era times $t_0 = 4.0, 3.0, \text{ and } 1.5$ Ga (dark blue, blue, and green) and average melt CO₂ = 300, 500, 1000, and 2000 ppm (solid, dashed, dashed-dotted, dotted) with $f_{volc} = 1.0$. There is no eruption rate line for $t_0 = 1.5$ Ga and CO₂ = 300 ppm because this would lead to a total erupted volume requiring processing of more than $1.2 \times$ Venus' mantle volume in 1.5 Ga in order to degas the full 90 bar of CO₂ in Venus' modern atmosphere. The eruption rates shown in these curves will be lower for smaller values of f_{volc} as less of the total CO₂ in Venus' modern atmosphere is derived from volcanic degassing in these cases.



Fig. S3. Example atmospheric ⁴⁰Ar accumulation for a range of crustal production rates, set by melt CO₂ concentrations (as in Fig S2 and Equations 13-16 in the Main Text).



Fig. S4. Schematic illustration of our 40 Ar degassing model based on: (3, 21).



Fig. S5. Summary of ⁴⁰Ar degassing model results shown as the percentage of ⁴⁰Ar evolution models (e.g. Fig S3) that contribute less than $1.61 \pm 0.54 \times 10^{16}$ kg ⁴⁰Ar (21) to Venus' atmosphere over the course of Venus' post-habitable era evolution. The most favorable parameters for successful Ar degassing model runs are anticorrelated with parameters that reconcile a hypothetical early habitable era with Venus' modern atmospheric O₂. ⁴⁰Ar degassing models where ⁴⁰K crust is not re-mixed into the mantle after recycling at the base of the crust permit a wider range of parameter space to be compatible with modern ⁴⁰Ar in Venus' atmosphere. Blue circles correspond to results of 57,000 models where material recycled from the base of the crust is mixed uniformly throughout the mantle. Black circles correspond to results of 57,000 models where material recycled from the base of the crust is mixed uniformly throughout the mantle. Black circles correspond to results of 57,000 models where material recycled from the base of the crust is mixed uniformly throughout the mantle. Black circles correspond to results of 57,000 models where material recycled from the base of the crust is mixed uniformly throughout the mantle. Black circles correspond to results of 57,000 models where "recycled routs becomes part of a separate mantle reservoir and does not alter the ⁴⁰K concentration of the mantle from which new crust is derived. f_{pre} is the fraction of mantle ⁴⁰Ar produced from the formation of Venus until the end of the hypothetical habitable era that is assumed to have already degassed and remained in the atmosphere. Melt CO₂ concentration, fraction of Venus' present day atmosphere contributed by post-habitable era volcanic degassing (f_{volc}), and extrusive volcanism fraction (f_{ext}) have the same values as in the O₂ loss models. Table S2 lists all model variables and their values.



Fig. S6. Steady-state pressure-temperature profiles for Venus lithosphere with a constant advection velocity of $v = 400 \text{ km Gyr}^{-1}$ (to degas a total of 90 bar CO₂ over the course of a 0.5 Gyr hypothetical habitable era on Venus). Colors indicate different lithospheric thicknesses ranging from $z_{lith} = 25-200 \text{ km}$, and solid, dash-dotted, dashed, and dotted lines indicate crustal internal heat production rates from $H = 0.5 \mu \text{Wm}^{-3}$. The blue and green lines show phase boundaries corresponding to serpentinite dehydration (27) and eclogite formation (28). We assume that all pressure-temperature profiles that cross into the eclogite formation field before the serpentinite dehydration field are able to recycle hydrated lithosphere into the mantle through entrainment of dense eclogite into the convecting mantle (1).



Fig. S7. Example evolutions of habitable era water inventory in km GEL for a habitable era starting with 4000 m water on the surface, with a constant atmospheric CO_2 pressure of 1 bar, for a range of H_2O mass fractions in hydrated crust (a & d. 0.5 wt%; b & e. 1 wt%; c & f. 3 wt%) and melt CO_2 concentrations (a,b, & c. 300 ppm; d, e & f. 1000 ppm). Dashed lines indicate upper limits on end-habitable-era surface water inventory from O_2 loss and ⁴⁰Ar degassing models (500 m-black dashed, 1000 m-black dotted for very reduced melt oxygen fugacities). The final size of the surface liquid water inventory must fall below these lines by the end of the habitable era at 4.0 Ga to be consistent with Venus' modern atmospheric composition.



Fig. S8. Although the final surface water inventory at the end of the habitable era must be less than 500 m GEL (or 1000 m GEL for a very reducing melt oxygen fugacity), recycling of water into the mantle during the habitable era can lead to an average surface water inventory larger than these upper limits. Example runs that meet these conditions are shown by the circled points A (Panel a.) and A' (Panel b.), B (Panel a.) and B' (Panel b.), C (Panel a.) and C' (Panel b.). a. Final size of the habitable era water inventory after evolution of the surface water inventory in km GEL. Horizontal dashed line indicates upper limit on end-habitable-era surface water inventory from O₂ loss and ⁴⁰Ar models. The final size of the habitable era water inventory during the same habitable era. Horizontal black line is the same as for a., but the average water inventory does not need to fall beneath these lines to be consistent with Ovens' modern atmosphere.



Fig. S9. Example sensitivity tests with values of binary diffusion coefficient of hydrogen through the background atmosphere (b_H) 30% lower $(0.7b_H)$, blue) and 30% higher $(1.3b_H)$, red) than our baseline model (black, shown in d, e, and f). Colors are transparent and curves appear purple where $0.7b_H$, baseline b_H , and $1.3b_H$ results overlap. We set 500m GEL end habitable era water inventory, 500 ppm melt CO₂, 0.5 wt% melt H₂O, $f_{ext} = 0.3$, $\log fO_2 = FMQ-3$, and a f_{volc} = ranging from 0.1 to 0.9 (indicated by solid, dotted, and dashed lines). a-c show the percent difference in the atmospheric concentration of O₂, H₂O, and CO relative to the baseline b_H used in our O₂ loss model. CO curves are absent where the atmospheric CO concentration in the baseline model is 0. Initial, short-lived spikes in CO concentration are due to CO degassing prior to O₂ accumulation due to H escape to space. d-f show the atmospheric concentration of each species in the model divided by the maximum atmospheric concentration as constrained by modern Venus measurements. The horizontal dashed black line indicates where atmospheric concentration exactly matches the relevant modern constraint–curves that end below this line are deemed "successful" in our model. $\pm 30\%$ variations in b_H do not affect whether a given model run is successful for any parameter combination.



Fig. S10. Example sensitivity tests with values of $T_{atm} = 170$ K and 215 K compared with our baseline model that uses $T_{atm} = 215$ K (black, shown in d, e, and f). Colors are transparent and curves appear purple where 170 K, baseline, and 215 K results overlap. We set 500m GEL end habitable era water inventory, 500 ppm melt CO₂, 0.5 wt% melt H₂O, $f_{ext} = 0.3$, $\log fO_2 =$ FMQ-3, and a $f_{volc} =$ ranging from 0.1 to 1.0 (indicated by solid, dotted, dashed lines, and dashed-dotted lines). a-c show the percent difference in the atmospheric concentration of O₂, H₂O, and CO relative to the baseline b_H used in our O₂ loss model. CO curves are absent where the atmospheric CO concentration in the baseline model is 0. Initial, short-lived spikes in CO concentration are due to CO degassing prior to O₂ accumulation due to H escape to space. d-f show the atmospheric concentration of each species in the model divided by the maximum atmospheric constraint-curves that end below this line are deemed "successful" in our model. These variations in T_{atm} do not affect whether a given model run is successful for any parameter combination.

Table S1. Coefficient values used in calculation of surface temperature as a function of effective stellar luminosity and partial pressure of water in the atmosphere (11).

Coefficient	Value	Coefficient	Value
$\overline{c_1}$	3.401	k_1	2.668
c_2	1.501×10^{-1}	k_2	1.019
c_3	-3.401 $\times 10^{-2}$	k_3	1.099
c_4	4.702×10^{-2}	k_4	0.4683
c_5	-4.911×10^{-3}	k_5	0.7664
c_6	8.519 $ imes 10^{-1}$	k_6	0.4224
c_7	-1.467×10^{-2}		
c_8	-7.091 $\times 10^{-3}$		
c_9	-7.627×10^{-3}		
c_{10}	8.348 $\times 10^{-3}$		

Symbol	Description	Values	Units
t_0	End of habitable era (as in Table 1)	4, 3, 1.5	Ga
z_{crust}	Crust thickness	5, 10, 20, 30, 50	km
ϕ	Mantle melt fraction for crust production	0.025, 0.05	
c_{CO_2}	Melt CO_2 concentration (as in Table 1)	300, 500, 1000, 2000	ppm
f_{pre}	Fraction of radiogenic 40 Ar degassed before end of habitable era	0, 0.1, 0.25, 0.5, 1	
f_{volc}	Fraction of present day atmospheric CO_2 degassed since end of habitable era (as in Table 1)	0.1, 0.5, 0.9, 1	
f_{ext}	Extrusive volcanism fraction (as in Table 1)	0.1, 0.3, 0.5, 1	
$c_{U,M}$	Primordial mantle U concentration	13, 17, 21 (<mark>3, 21</mark>)	ppb
$r_{K/U}$	K/U ratio	7200 (21), 13800 (33)	

Table S2. Parameter values used in $^{\rm 40}{\rm Ar}$ degassing model.

164 **References**

- M Armann, PJ Tackley, Simulating the thermochemical magmatic and tectonic evolution of Venus's mantle and lithosphere: Two-dimensional models. J. Geophys. Res. Planets 117 (2012).
- LT Elkins-Tanton, SE Smrekar, PC Hess, EM Parmentier, Volcanism and volatile recycling on a one-plate planet:
 Applications to Venus. J. Geophys. Res. Planets 112 (2007).
- 3. JG O'Rourke, J Korenaga, Thermal evolution of Venus with argon degassing. *Icarus* 260, 128 140 (2015).
- K Cutler, J Filiberto, AH Treiman, D Trang, Experimental investigation of oxidation of pyroxene and basalt: Implications for spectroscopic analyses of the surface of Venus and the ages of lava flows. *Planet. Sci. J.* 1, 21 (2020).
- 5. B Fegley Jr, et al., Basalt oxidation and the formation of hematite on the surface of Venus. *Icarus* **118**, 373–383 (1995).
- 6. G Berger, et al., Experimental exploration of volcanic rocks-atmosphere interaction under Venus surface conditions. *Icarus* **329**, 8–23 (2019).
- 7. JW Head III, L Wilson, Volcanic processes and landforms on Venus: Theory, predictions, and observations. J. Geophys.
 Res. Solid Earth 91, 9407–9446 (1986).
- 8. RF Cooper, JB Fanselow, DB Poker, The mechanism of oxidation of a basaltic glass: Chemical diffusion of network modifying cations. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* 60, 3253 3265 (1996).
- 9. D Canil, K Muehlenbachs, Oxygen diffusion in an Fe-rich basalt melt. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta 54, 2947–2951
 (1990).
- 10. RF Wendlandt, Oxygen diffusion in basalt and andesite melts: experimental results and discussion of chemical versus
 tracer diffusion. *Contributions to Mineral. Petrol.* 108, 463–471 (1991).
- 11. M Turbet, et al., Revised mass-radius relationships for water-rich rocky planets more irradiated than the runaway
 greenhouse limit. Astron. & Astrophys. 638, A41 (2020).
- 12. F Tian, History of water loss and atmospheric O_2 buildup on rocky exoplanets near M dwarfs. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 186 **432**, 126–132 (2015).
- 13. C Helo, MA Longpré, N Shimizu, DA Clague, J Stix, Explosive eruptions at mid-ocean ridges driven by CO₂-rich magmas.
 Nat. Geosci. 4, 260–263 (2011).
- 14. CI Schipper, JD White, B Houghton, N Shimizu, RB Stewart, Explosive submarine eruptions driven by volatile-coupled degassing at Lō'ihi Seamount, Hawai'i. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 295, 497 510 (2010).
- 15. RC Ghail, L Wilson, A pyroclastic flow deposit on Venus. Geol. Soc. London, Special Publ. 401, 97–106 (2015).
- 16. BA Campbell, et al., Pyroclastic flow deposits on Venus as indicators of renewed magmatic activity. J. Geophys. Res.
 Planets 122, 1580–1596 (2017).
- 17. MW Airey, et al., Explosive volcanic activity on Venus: the roles of volatile contribution, degassing, and external
 environment. *Planet. Space Sci.* 113, 33–48 (2015).
- 18. LS Glaze, SM Baloga, J Wimert, Explosive volcanic eruptions from linear vents on Earth, Venus, and Mars: Comparisons
 with circular vent eruptions. J. Geophys. Res. Planets 116 (2011).
- 19. R Sparks, The dynamics of bubble formation and growth in magmas: A review and analysis. J. Volcanol. Geotherm. Res. 199 $\mathbf{3}, 1-37$ (1978).
- 200 20. JB Garvin, JW Head, L Wilson, Magma vesiculation and pyroclastic volcanism on Venus. Icarus 52, 365 372 (1982).
- 201 21. WM Kaula, Constraints on Venus Evolution from Radiogenic Argon. *Icarus* **139**, 32 39 (1999).
- 222 22. DJ Stevenson, T Spohn, G Schubert, Magnetism and thermal evolution of the terrestrial planets. *Icarus* **54**, 466–489 (1983).
- 23. T Spohn, Mantle differentiation and thermal evolution of Mars, Mercury, and Venus. Icarus 90, 222–236 (1991).
- 24. DM Shaw, Trace element fractionation during anatexis. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta 34, 237–243 (1970).
- 206 25. TC O'Reilly, GF Davies, Magma transport of heat on Io: A mechanism allowing a thick lithosphere. *Geophysical Research* 207 Letters 8, 313–316 (1981).
- 26. DG Kankanamge, WB Moore, A parameterization for volcanic heat flux in heat pipe planets. J. Geophys. Res. Planets 124, 114–127 (2019).
- 210 27. BR Hacker, GA Abers, SM Peacock, Subduction factory 1. Theoretical mineralogy, densities, seismic wave speeds, and
 H₂O contents. J. Geophys. Res. Solid Earth 108 (2003).
- 212 28. K Bucher, M Frey, Metamorphism of mafic rocks in Petrogenesis of Metamorphic Rocks. (Springer), pp. 279–324 (2002).
- 213 29. MJ Way, et al., Was Venus the first habitable world of our solar system? Geophys. Res. Lett. 43, 8376–8383 (2016).
- 30. MJ Way, AD Del Genio, Venusian Habitable Climate Scenarios: Modeling Venus Through Time and Applications to Slowly Rotating Venus-Like Exoplanets. J. Geophys. Res. Planets **125**, e2019JE006276 (2020).
- 216 31. L Schaefer, D Sasselov, The persistence of oceans on Earth-like planets: Insights from the deep-water cycle. Astrophys. J.
 217 801, 40 (2015).
- 32. P Rosenblatt, P Pinet, E Thouvenot, Comparative hypsometric analysis of Earth and Venus. Geophys. Res. Lett. 21, 465–468 (1994).
- 33. R Arevalo Jr, WF McDonough, M Luong, The K/U ratio of the silicate Earth: Insights into mantle composition, structure
 and thermal evolution. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 278, 361–369 (2009).